

PLACES OF REFUGE

International Law and the CMI Draft Convention

JOHAN BURTON AND STEPHEN HERRINGTON

BY

PROF DR ERIC VAN HOOYDONK

Professor of Law, Ghent University and University of Antwerp

Advocate

315

SARCHI CHAIR LAW

informa law
from Routledge

First published 2010 by Lloyd's List

Published 2014

by Informa Law from Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Informa Law from Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY, 10017, USA

Informa Law is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© Prof Dr Eric Van Hooydonk 2010

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Whilst every effort has been made to ensure that the information contained in this work is correct, neither the authors nor Informa Law from Routledge can accept any responsibility for any errors or omissions or for any consequences arising therefrom.

Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

[Lloyd's is the registered trade mark of the Society incorporated by the Lloyd's Act 1871 by the name of Lloyd's]

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN 13: 978-1-843-11841-1 (hbk)

Text set in 10/12pt Plantin by Interactive Sciences Ltd, Gloucester



Printed and bound in Great Britain by
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

Contents

<i>Foreword by Karl-Johan Gombrii and Stuart Hetherington</i>	v
<i>Foreword by Dirk Sterckx</i>	ix
<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Contents</i>	xiii
<i>Table of International Instruments</i>	xix
<i>Table of IMO Instruments</i>	xxv
<i>Table of European Instruments</i>	xxvii
<i>Table of National Legislation</i>	xxix
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxxix
<i>Bibliography</i>	xxxiii
<i>List of Acronyms and Abbreviations</i>	liii
<i>The Author</i>	lvii
1. INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	1
2. THE CONTEXT OF RECENT POLICY DEVELOPMENTS	3
2.1. Notable shipping incidents	3
2.2. The regulatory response	5
2.2.1. The response from the International Maritime Organization	5
2.2.1.1. The IMO Guidelines on places of refuge for ships in need of assistance	5
2.2.1.2. The rejection by the IMO Legal Committee of a treaty initiative	7
2.2.2. The response from regional organisations	9
2.2.2.1. The EU VTMIS Directive	9
2.2.2.2. Operational agreements within regional coastal State organisations	12
2.2.3. The response from States	13
2.3. Uncertainty about international law on the accommodation of ships in need of assistance in places of refuge	14
3. CURRENT INTERNATIONAL LAW ON THE ACCOMMODATION OF SHIPS IN DISTRESS IN PLACES OF REFUGE	17
3.1. Methodology and classification of relevant legal sources	17
3.2. Summary of the right of access under customary law	21
3.3. Conventions	26
3.3.1. The International Régime of Maritime Ports	26
3.3.2. The Geneva Territorial Sea Convention	28
3.3.2.1. Importance	28
3.3.2.2. State sovereignty	29
3.3.2.3. Instances of innocent passage	29
3.3.2.4. Stopping and anchoring in the territorial sea	30
3.3.2.5. Innocence of passage	33
3.3.2.6. Measures by coastal States	34

CONTENTS

3.3.2.7.	Meaning of French "relâche forcée"	36
3.3.2.8.	Ships already distressed before entering the territorial sea	37
3.3.2.9.	Laws and regulations of the coastal State	39
3.3.2.10.	Suspension of innocent passage	40
3.3.2.11.	Charges levied upon ships	40
3.3.2.12.	Conclusion	40
3.3.3.	The UN Law of the Sea Convention	41
3.3.3.1.	General scope of the Convention	41
3.3.3.2.	Overview of relevant rules	42
3.3.3.3.	State sovereignty	42
3.3.3.4.	Instances of innocent passage	42
3.3.3.5.	Stopping and anchoring in the territorial sea	44
3.3.3.6.	Innocence of passage	47
3.3.3.7.	Laws and regulations of the coastal State	49
3.3.3.8.	Measures by coastal States	49
3.3.3.9.	The International Law Association's position on casualty ships	52
3.3.3.10.	Suspension of innocent passage	55
3.3.3.11.	Charges levied upon ships	56
3.3.3.12.	Duty to render assistance	57
3.3.3.13.	Protection of the marine environment	58
3.3.3.14.	Enforcement immunity of ships in distress	61
3.3.3.15.	Conclusion	61
3.3.4.	The Intervention Convention	62
3.3.5.	The London Salvage Convention	68
3.3.6.	Other relevant multilateral conventions	70
3.3.7.	Bilateral friendship, commerce and navigation treaties	74
3.3.8.	Treaties on international waterways	77
3.4.	Case law	78
3.4.1.	Significance and selection	78
3.4.2.	<i>The Eleanor</i> (1809)	79
3.4.3.	<i>The Schooner Exchange</i> (1812)	80
3.4.4.	<i>The New York</i> (1818)	81
3.4.5.	<i>The North Atlantic Coast Fisheries Case</i> (1910)	81
3.4.6.	<i>The Rebecca</i> (1929)	82
3.4.7.	<i>The Stanislaw Dubois</i> (1981)	83
3.4.8.	<i>Poulsen (The Onkel Sam)</i> (1992)	85
3.4.9.	<i>The Frontier</i> (1992)	86
3.4.10.	<i>The Toledo</i> (1995)	87
3.4.11.	<i>The Long Lin</i> (1995)	90
3.4.12.	Synthesis	93
3.5.	The IMO Guidelines on places of refuge for ships in need of assistance	94
3.6.	European law	99
3.6.1.	European Union Law	99
3.6.2.	Other regional European law	109
3.7.	National regulations and administrative practice	111
3.8.	General principles of law	117
3.9.	Legal doctrine	117
3.9.1.	Classification of available material	117

CONTENTS

3.9.2.	Legal doctrine tending towards an absolute right of entry	121
3.9.3.	Legal doctrine tending towards a qualified right of entry	132
3.9.4.	Legal doctrine tending towards an absolute right of refusal	140
3.9.5.	Viewpoints in some recent in-depth studies	141
3.9.5.1.	Hydeman and Berman (1960)	141
3.9.5.2.	Devine (1991 and 1996)	143
3.9.5.3.	Lagoni (1988 and 2001)	144
3.9.5.4.	Van Hooydonk (2003)	145
3.9.5.5.	Somers (2004)	148
3.9.5.6.	Chircop (2006)	149
3.9.5.7.	Gadow-Stephani (2006)	151
3.9.5.8.	Nordquist (2007)	152
3.9.5.9.	Ringbom (2008)	154
3.10.	Synthesis and attempt at elucidation	155
3.10.1.	The state of international law	155
3.10.2.	Present-day relevance of the right of entry	156
3.10.3.	The need for a precise delineation of the right of refusal	162
3.10.3.1.	Legal uncertainty in respect of the foundations and outlines of the right of refusal	162
3.10.3.2.	First position: refusal of entry on the basis of "circumstances precluding wrongfulness"	164
3.10.3.3.	Second position: refusal of entry integrated into the primary legal regime of the accommodation of ships in distress	167
3.10.3.4.	Conclusion: the customary law outlines of the right of refusal of entry and the powers of judicial review	170
3.11.	Towards a codification of a presumption of entry and principles of good administration	177
4.	THE GENESIS, NECESSITY AND STATUS OF THE CMI DRAFT CONVENTION	179
4.1.	Genesis of the CMI Draft Convention	179
4.1.1.	CMI activities before the Athens Conference	179
4.1.2.	The CMI Conference in Athens	180
4.2.	Necessity of the CMI Draft Convention	182
4.2.1.	Demonstration of a "compelling need"	182
4.2.2.	Absence of well-founded objections to a treaty regulation	187
4.3.	Status of the CMI Draft Convention	191
4.3.1.	"Draft Instrument" or "Draft Convention"?	191
4.3.2.	Relationship between the CMI Draft Convention and other sources of law	192
4.3.2.1.	A distinction based on the current status of the instrument	192
4.3.2.2.	The CMI Draft Convention as a codification instrument adopted by an NGO	192
4.3.2.3.	The CMI Draft Convention after its entry into force as an international treaty	195
4.3.2.3.1.	Relation to national law	195
4.3.2.3.2.	Relation to other international instruments	196
4.3.2.3.3.	Relation to European Union law	198

CONTENTS

5.	CONTENT OF THE CMI DRAFT CONVENTION	203
5.1.	Structure of the CMI Draft Convention	203
5.2.	Analysis of the preamble	203
5.2.1.	First recital: the importance of the availability of places of refuge	204
5.2.2.	Second recital: the necessity of taking into account all interests involved	204
5.2.3.	Third recital: the necessity of a clarification of the international liability regime	205
5.2.4.	Fourth recital: uncertainty regarding the right of access under customary law	206
5.2.5.	Fifth recital: reference to IMO instruments	207
5.2.6.	Sixth recital: the need for a legally binding instrument regarding the granting or refusal of entry to ships in need of assistance	209
5.2.7.	Seventh recital: purpose of the CMI Draft Convention	209
5.3.	Analysis of the material provisions	211
5.3.1.	Article 1: Definitions	211
5.3.1.1.	General tenor	211
5.3.1.2.	The notion of a "ship"	211
5.3.1.3.	The notion of a "ship in need of assistance"	214
5.3.1.4.	The notion of a "place of refuge"	224
5.3.1.5.	The notion of a "competent authority"	227
5.3.1.6.	The notion of an "assessment"	232
5.3.1.7.	The notion of a "ship owner"	234
5.3.1.8.	The notion of a "registered owner"	235
5.3.2.	Article 2: Object and purpose	235
5.3.3.	Article 3: Legal obligation to grant access to a place of refuge	237
5.3.3.1.	Three alternative wordings	237
5.3.3.2.	The obligation in principle to grant access	237
5.3.3.3.	First option: refusal of access on grounds of a risk assessment	240
5.3.3.4.	Second option: refusal of access on grounds of a risk assessment and taking into account financial securities	246
5.3.3.5.	Third option: refusal of access on grounds of a risk assessment or the absence of financial securities	248
5.3.3.6.	Relationship to international customary law concerning access to places of refuge	250
5.3.3.7.	The obligation to seek alternative solutions	253
5.3.3.8.	Reservation regarding the competent authority's right to make a claim for salvage	256
5.3.4.	Article 4: Immunity from liability where access is granted reasonably	259
5.3.5.	Article 5: Liability to another State, a third party, the ship owner or salvor where refusal of access is unreasonable	265
5.3.5.1.	Scope of the liability	265
5.3.5.2.	Right to sue	270
5.3.5.3.	Liable authorities	272
5.3.5.4.	Burden of proof	273
5.3.5.5.	Breach of duty on the part of the competent authority under the marine pollution liability conventions	279
5.3.6.	Article 6: Reasonable conduct	282

CONTENTS

5.3.7.	Article 7: Guarantees	287
5.3.7.1.	The necessity of a regulation	287
5.3.7.2.	First option: limitation of financial security to a reasonable amount not exceeding the LLMC limit for property claims	292
5.3.7.3.	Second option: limitation of financial security to a reasonable amount not exceeding the LLMC limit for property claims and a reasonable additional amount for wreck removal	307
5.3.7.4.	Third option: limitation of the financial security to a reasonable amount	308
5.3.8.	Article 8: Plans to accommodate ships in need of assistance	309
5.3.9.	Article 9: Identification of competent authority	313
5.4.	Matters not regulated by the CMI Draft Convention	315
6.	COMPARISON OF THE CMI DRAFT CONVENTION WITH THE EUROPEAN REGIME OF PLACES OF REFUGE	323
6.1.	Similarities	323
6.2.	Differences	324
7.	THE FURTHER ROLE OF THE CMI DRAFT CONVENTION	327
7.1.	Discussion as a draft convention by the Legal Committee of the International Maritime Organization	327
7.2.	Possible impact on international customary law, regional regulations, operational decision-making and case law	329
8.	CONCLUSIONS	331
8.1.	Current state of international law	331
8.2.	Significance of the CMI Draft Convention	331
9.	APPENDICES	333
9.1.	CMI documents	333
9.1.1.	The CMI Draft Instrument	333
9.1.1.1.	CMI Draft Instrument on Places of Refuge (final version of 17 October 2008)	333
9.1.1.2.	Resolution adopted by the 39th CMI Conference in connection with the Draft Instrument on Places of Refuge – Athens 17 October 2008	337
9.1.2.	Other CMI documents	337
9.1.2.1.	Draft version of the CMI Draft Instrument on Places of Refuge as submitted to the CMI Cape Town Colloquium (2006)	337
9.1.2.2.	Draft version of the CMI Draft Instrument on Places of Refuge as submitted to the CMI Athens Conference (2008)	341
9.1.2.3.	Final Report of the CMI to the Legal Committee of the IMO (IMO Doc. LEG 95/9, 23 January 2009)	346
9.2.	IMO Documents	356
9.2.1.	IMO Guidelines on places of refuge for ships in need of assistance	356
9.2.2.	IMO Guidelines on the control of ships in an emergency	364

CONTENTS

9.2.3.	Report of the Legal Committee on the work of its ninety-fifth session (IMO Doc. LEG 95/10, 22 April 2009) (excerpt)	369
9.3.	EU Documents	370
9.3.1.	Directive 2002/59/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 27 June 2002 establishing a Community vessel traffic monitoring and information system and repealing Council Directive 93/75/EEC	370
9.3.2.	European Parliament Resolution on improving safety at sea in response to the Prestige accident (2003/2066(INI))	387
9.3.3.	Proposal for a Directive of the European Parliament and of the Council amending Directive 2002/59/EC establishing a Community vessel traffic monitoring and information system (COM/2005/0589 final)	396
9.3.4.	Directive 2009/17/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 23 April 2009 amending Directive 2002/59/EC establishing a Community vessel traffic monitoring and information system	418
9.3.5.	Consolidated version of Directive 2002/59/EC establishing a Community vessel traffic monitoring and information system	433
9.4.	Summary of international law regimes of ships in need of assistance	459
	Index	461