

The Regime of Islands Reframed

*Developments in the Definition of Islands
under the International Law of the Sea*

By

Clive Schofield



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

This paperback book edition is simultaneously published as issue 3.1–2 of *The Law of the Sea*,
DOI:10.1163/24519359-12340008.

Library Congress Control Number: 2020950989

Contents

The Regime of Islands Reframed: Developments in the Definition of Islands under the International Law of the Sea 1

Clive Schofield

Abstract	1
Keywords	1
1 Introduction	1
2 Defining Islands	3
2.1 <i>International Legal Categorisation of Insular Features</i>	3
2.2 <i>Historical Developments in the Definition of Islands</i>	5
2.2.1 Early Codification Efforts	5
2.2.2 The Drafting History of Article 121 of the LOSC	6
2.3 <i>The Regime of Islands under the LOSC</i>	8
2.3.1 Key Requirements for Insular Status	10
2.3.1.1 <i>Naturally Formed</i>	10
2.3.1.2 <i>Area of Land</i>	13
2.3.1.3 <i>Surrounded by Water</i>	14
2.3.1.4 <i>Above High Tide</i>	14
2.3.2 Rocks	23
2.4 <i>Progress towards the Clarification of the Regime of Islands</i>	23
2.4.1 State Practice	24
2.4.2 Treatment of Islands in Judicial Decisions	27
2.4.3 Views of Commentators	31
3 The Regime of Islands Reframed: The South China Sea Award and Article 121	34
3.1 <i>The Tribunal's Initial Considerations on the Status of Insular Features</i>	36
3.2 <i>The Tribunal's Interpretation of and Findings on Article 121</i>	39
3.2.1 Rock	42
3.2.2 Natural Capacity	44
3.2.3 Cannot	45
3.2.4 Sustain	45
3.2.5 Human Habitation	46
3.2.6 Economic Life of Their Own	48
3.2.7 Or	51
3.2.8 Present and Past Capacity	52
3.2.9 Assessment on a Case-by-Case Basis	52
3.2.10 Groups of Islands Sustaining Human Habitation and Economic Life	53

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-44946-6 (paperback)

ISBN 978-90-04-44947-3 (e-book)

Copyright 2021 by Clive Schofield. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.
Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi,
Brill Sense, Hotei Publishing, mentis Verlag, Verlag Ferdinand Schöningh and Wilhelm Fink Verlag.
Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect this publication against unauthorized use. Requests for
re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Printed by Printforce, United Kingdom

	3.2.11	Borderline Cases	54
	3.2.12	Context of Article 121(3) and the Object and Purpose of the LOSC	55
	3.3	<i>Application to the Spratly Islands and Scarborough Reef</i>	58
4		Almost Islands?: Low-tide Elevations and Artificial Islands	62
	4.1	<i>Low-tide Elevations</i>	62
	4.2	<i>Artificial Islands, Installations and Structures</i>	66
	4.3	<i>Submerged Banks and Shoals</i>	70
5		Reactions to the South China Sea Award	71
	5.1	<i>International Responses</i>	71
	5.2	<i>Scholarly Views</i>	77
	5.2.1	The term "Rock"	78
	5.2.2	Does Size Matter?	79
	5.2.3	Natural State	79
	5.2.4	Historical Evidence	80
	5.2.5	Human Habitation and Economic Life	81
	5.2.6	Consistency with Past Jurisprudence	81
	5.2.7	State Practice	82
	5.2.8	Artificial Islands and Island-building Activities	85
	5.2.9	Chinese Views	85
6		Conclusions and Implications	89
	6.1	<i>Setting a High Standard</i>	90
	6.2	<i>Confirmations and Clarifications in the Definition of Islands</i>	91
	6.3	<i>Remaining Uncertainties and Fresh Scope for Conflicting Interpretation</i>	93
	6.4	<i>Scope for Flexibility</i>	94
	6.5	<i>Charting a New Course towards Defining Islands: A Three-stage Process</i>	95
	6.6	<i>Implications</i>	96
	6.6.1	Implications of the Arbitration Award for the South China Sea disputes	97
	6.6.2	Implications beyond the South China Sea	106
	6.7	<i>The Last Word on the Issue?</i>	108
		List of Figures	110
		Acknowledgments	110
		Author Biography	111
		References	112