

# The Other Australia/Japan Living Marine Resources Dispute

*Inferences on the Merits of the Southern Bluefin Tuna  
Arbitration in Light of the Whaling Case*

By

Andrew Serdy



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

213

213

SARCHE CHAIR LAW

## Contents

### The Other Australia/Japan Living Marine Resources Dispute

#### *Inferences on the Merits of the Southern Bluefin Tuna*

#### *Arbitration in Light of the Whaling Case* 1

Andrew Serdy

Abstract	1
Keywords	1
1 Introduction	2
2 The <i>Whaling</i> Case Judgment	5
3 Southern Bluefin Tuna: The Fish	10
4 Historical Overview of the Japanese SBT Fishery	13
5 First Interactions	17
6 The State of the Stock	19
7 The First Quotas and Their Subsequent Reduction	21
8 Gestation of the Dispute—Interpretation of CPUE	24
9 Impasse in the CCSBT	32
10 Japan's Experimental Fishing	35
11 The Relevant Law Identified in the Statements of Claim	37
12 The ITLOS Hearing and Order	41
13 The Parties' Arguments before the Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal	43
14 The Annex VII Arbitral Tribunal's Award on Jurisdiction	45
15 Resolution of the Dispute	51
a <i>The SBT Scientific Research Program</i>	51
b <i>Japanese Commercial Catch Affected by the ITLOS Order</i>	52
c <i>The New-Old Quota of 2003</i>	53
16 Issues Left Unresolved Because the Case did not go to the Merits	55
a <i>Possible Damaging Admissions by Japan in the Indian Ocean Tuna Commission</i>	55
b <i>Best Scientific Evidence (Design of the Experimental Fishing Programme and Analysis of Its Results)</i>	56
c <i>The Allegation that Japan's Experimental Fishing was Commercially Motivated</i>	60
d <i>Decision-making in the CCSBT and the Duty of Cooperation</i>	64
e <i>The Relationship between Conservation and Optimum Utilisation</i>	68
17 Concluding Observations	69

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: [brill.com/brill-typeface](http://brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISBN 978-90-04-33944-6 (paperback)

ISBN 978-90-04-33945-3 (e-book)

Originally published as Volume 1(1) 2017, in *The Law of the Sea*, DOI 10.1163/24519359-12340001.

Copyright 2017 by Andrew Serdy. Published by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi and Hotei Publishing.

Koninklijke Brill NV reserves the right to protect the publication against unauthorized use and to authorize dissemination by means of offprints, legitimate photocopies, microform editions, reprints, translations, and secondary information sources, such as abstracting and indexing services including databases. Requests for commercial re-use, use of parts of the publication, and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill NV.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.



Appendix: SBT Fishery Science 70  
*Maximum Sustainable Yield—The Surplus Production Model of Fisheries* 70  
*Virtual Population Analysis* 73  
*Scientific Advice to Managers* 75  
References 85