

Disappearing Island States in International Law

By

Jenny Grote Stoutenburg



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

196

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Grote Stoutenburg, Jenny, author.

Disappearing island states in international law / by Jenny Grote Stoutenburg.
pages cm

Based on author's thesis (doctoral—University of Hamburg, 2014).

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-30300-3 (hardback : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-90-04-30301-0 (e-book)

1. Islands—Law and legislation. 2. Submerged lands—Law and legislation. 3. Climatic changes—Law and legislation. 4. Islands of the Pacific—International status. 5. Islands of the Indian Ocean—International status. I. Title.

KZ3880.G76 2015

341.4'2—dc23

201502302

This publication has been typeset in the multilingual 'Brill' typeface. With over 5,100 characters covering Latin, IPA, Greek, and Cyrillic, this typeface is especially suitable for use in the humanities. For more information, please see brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-30300-3 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-30301-0 (e-book)

Copyright 2015 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi and Hotei Publishing.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill nv provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Printed by Printforce, the Netherlands

Contents

Acknowledgements	IX
List of Abbreviations	X
Table of Treaties	XIV

Introduction	1
--------------	---

PART 1

Fathoming the Waters

1	Small Island States and the Threat of Anthropogenic Climate Change	11
1.1	Introduction	11
1.2	Historical Overview: The Changing Tides of Small Island States Discourse	11
1.2.1	<i>1972–1982: Developing Island Countries and the Overcoming of Structural Barriers to Socioeconomic Development</i>	12
1.2.2	<i>1983–1992: Island Developing Countries and the Flagging Momentum for Support to Development</i>	17
1.2.3	<i>Since 1992: Small Island Developing States and Sustainable Development in the Face of Climate Change</i>	19
1.2.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	29
1.3	The Impacts of Climate Change and Sea Level Rise on Small Island States	30
1.3.1	<i>Predictions of Sea Level Rise by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change</i>	30
1.3.2	<i>The Vulnerability of Small Island States to the Effects of Climate Change</i>	33
1.3.3	<i>Adaptation Strategies</i>	43
1.3.4	<i>The Risk of Island Abandonment</i>	50
1.4	The Climate Change Regime—An Inadequate Response to the Concerns of Small Island States	52
1.4.1	<i>The UNFCCC</i>	53
1.4.2	<i>The Kyoto Protocol and Beyond</i>	60
1.4.3	<i>Conclusion</i>	70

196

SARCHI CHAIR LAW

PART 2
Maritime Entitlements

- 2 The Effect of Sea Level Rise on the Maritime Entitlements of Small Island States 73**
- 2.1 Introduction 73
- 2.2 Island States in the International Law of the Sea 76
- 2.2.1 *The Silence of the Law of the Sea Regarding Island States* 76
- 2.2.2 *Archipelagic States* 79
- 2.2.3 *The Regime of Islands* 82
- 2.2.4 *Low-Tide Elevations* 90
- 2.3 The Maritime Zones of Islands 91
- 2.3.1 *The Territorial Sea* 91
- 2.3.2 *Archipelagic Waters* 93
- 2.3.3 *The Continental Shelf* 94
- 2.3.4 *The EEZ* 122
- 2.4 The Shrinking of Maritime Zones Due to Sea Level Rise 126
- 2.4.1 *The Law of Baselines* 127
- 2.4.2 *The Ambulatory Nature of Baselines* 130
- 2.4.3 *The Stabilizing Effect of Maritime Delimitation Agreements or Judicial Dispute Settlements* 135
- 2.4.4 *The Shrinking of Undelimited Maritime Zones* 143
- 2.4.5 *From Island to Rock or Low-Tide Elevation?* 151
- 2.5 The Loss of Maritime Zones Due to State Extinction 160
- 2.5.1 *The Loss of Maritime Zones through the Loss of International Legal Personality* 161
- 2.5.2 *Possible Strategies to Preserve International Legal Personality* 161
- 2.6 Conclusion 185
- 3 A New Regime of Stable Maritime Zones 186**
- 3.1 Introduction 186
- 3.2 Desirability and Challenges of a New Regime of Stable Maritime Zones 186
- 3.2.1 *'The Land Dominates the Sea': The Entitlement to Maritime Zones Depends on Title to Territory* 187
- 3.2.2 *The Challenge of Adequate Management* 195
- 3.2.3 *The Spatial and Temporal Scope of Stabilization* 198

- 3-3 Unilateral Strategies Providing for Stable Maritime Zones 199
 - 3-3.1 *Physical: Artificial Protection of the Coastline* 200
 - 3-3.2 *Factual: 'Masterly Inactivity'* 201
 - 3-3.3 *Contractual: Maritime Boundary Delimitation Agreements* 203
 - 3-3.4 *Historical: Invocation of the Historic Waters Doctrine* 204
 - 3-3.5 *Progressive: Working Towards a New Rule of Customary International Law* 207
- 3-4 Collective Implementation Mechanisms of a New Regime of Stable Maritime Zones 210
 - 3-4.1 *Implementation Agreement on Sea Level Rise* 212
 - 3-4.2 *UN General Assembly Resolution on Stable Maritime Zones* 225
- 3-5 Stable Maritime Zones and 'Deterritorialized' States 232
- 3-6 Conclusion 235

PART 3

State Extinction and Continuity

- 4 When Do States Disappear? Thresholds of Effective Statehood 239
 - 4.1 States in International Law 239
 - 4.2 The Loss of Effective Statehood through Sea Level Rise 249
 - 4.2.1 *Defined Territory* 251
 - 4.2.2 *Permanent Population* 266
 - 4.2.3 *Government* 275
 - 4.2.4 *Independence* 291
 - 4.3 Conclusion 296
- 5 Who Determines Whether an Island State Has Disappeared? 298
 - 5.1 The Competence to Determine State Extinction 298
 - 5.2 Individual States 298
 - 5.3 The Community of States 301
 - 5.4 The Organized International Community: The United Nations 304
 - 5.5 Conclusion 314

6	The Continued Recognition of 'Deterritorialized' Island States	315
6.1	Introduction	315
6.2	A Duty of Continued Recognition of 'Deterritorialized' Island States Based on Considerations of Legality?	315
6.2.1	<i>The Influence of Considerations of Legality on the Recognition of States</i>	315
6.2.2	<i>Fundamental Norms Possibly Affected by the Disappearance of Small Island States</i>	333
6.2.3	<i>Serious Breach of a Peremptory Norm?</i>	362
6.2.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	374
6.3	Continued Recognition of 'Deterritorialized' Island States Based on Considerations of International Justice and Solidarity	375
6.3.1	<i>The Contents of 'Deterritorialized' Statehood</i>	375
6.3.2	<i>The Maintenance of International Legal Personality</i>	379
6.3.3	<i>'Deterritorialized' Statehood under International Oversight?</i>	382
6.3.4	<i>Implementing 'Deterritorialized' Statehood</i>	384
6.3.5	<i>The Lifespan of 'Deterritorialized' States</i>	385
6.3.6	<i>Conclusion</i>	387
7	The Consequences of State Extinction versus Continued Existence as a 'Deterritorialized' State or Legal Entity <i>Sui Generis</i>	388
7.1	Three Possible Scenarios	388
7.2	The Fate of the People	389
7.2.1	<i>Histories of Forced Relocation in the Pacific and Indian Ocean Regions</i>	389
7.2.2	<i>The Legal Status of Environmentally Displaced Persons</i>	396
7.2.3	<i>The Island State Ceases to Exist</i>	404
7.2.4	<i>The 'Deterritorialized' Island State Enjoys Continued Recognition</i>	423
7.2.5	<i>The Island State Survives as a Legal Entity <i>Sui Generis</i></i>	430
7.3	Membership in International Organizations	434
7.4	The Fate of Treaty Obligations	438
7.5	The Fate of State Assets and Debts	442
7.6	Conclusion	445
	Summary and Conclusion: The Limits of <i>Ex Post</i> Solidarity in the Context of Climate Change	447
	Bibliography	451
	Index	477