

SARCHI CHAIR LAW

Shipowners' Limitation of Liability

Barnabas W.B. Reynolds

Michael N. Tsimplis

38

Donated by
Institute of Maritime Law
Law School, University of Southampton
United Kingdom

 **Wolters Kluwer**
Law & Business

WAL RIAHO INORAS

Published by:
Kluwer Law International
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
Website: www.kluwerlaw.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:
Aspen Publishers, Inc.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@aspenpublishers.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:
Turpin Distribution Services Ltd.
Stratton Business Park
Pegasus Drive, Biggleswade
Bedfordshire SG18 8TQ
United Kingdom
Email: kluwerlaw@turpin-distribution.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-90-411-2465-4

© 2012 Kluwer Law International BV, The Netherlands

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to: Permissions Department, Wolters Kluwer Legal, 76 Ninth Avenue, 7th Floor, New York, NY 10011-5201, USA.
Email: permissions@kluwerlaw.com

Printed and Bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY.

Table of Contents

About the Authors	v
Foreword by the Rt. Hon. Lord Justice Gross	vii
Preface and Acknowledgement	ix
List of Abbreviations	xxi
List of Figures	xxxii
List of Tables	xxxiii
Table of Cases	xxxv
Table of Legislation	lxxvii
Table of EU Materials	lxxxiii
Table of Conventions	lxxxix
Part I Introduction	1
Chapter 1 How Limitation Issues Arise	3
1.1 The Nature of the Right to Limit Liability	3
1.2 The International Dimension	5
1.3 The International Global Limitation Conventions	6
	xi

Table of Contents

1.4	The International Specific Liability Regimes and the Right to Limit Liability	
1.5	Other Ways of Limiting Liability	
1.6	Who May Invoke Global Limitation	
1.7	How to Invoke Rights of Limitation	
1.7.1	Defence	10
1.7.2	Limitation Action and Limitation Fund	11
1.7.3	Which Approach to Choose	12
1.8	Results of Constituting a Limitation Fund Including the Release of Ship(s) from Arrest	13
1.9	Shortcomings of the Limitation Regimes	14
1.10	Scope of Book	17
 Part II The Right to Limit Liability under the Global Limitation Regimes		 19
 Chapter 2		
Tonnage and Value Based Limitation Systems		21
2.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	21
2.2	The 1957 Limitation Convention	23
2.3	Value Limit	23
2.4	Mixed International Regimes: The 1924 Limitation Convention	24
 Chapter 3		
Who May Invoke Global Limitation?		27
3.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	27
3.1.1	Persons Entitled to Limit Their Liability	27
3.1.2	Can Owners and Salvors Limit Liability against Each Other?	41
3.2	The 1924 and 1957 Limitation Conventions	43
3.3	The US Position	44
 Chapter 4		
For Which Types of Vessel Is Limitation Available?		47
4.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	48
4.2	The 1924 and 1957 Limitation Conventions	50
4.3	The US Position	51
4.4	General Issues	51
 Chapter 5		
The Claims to Which Limitation May Apply		53
5.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	53
5.1.1	Claims Subject to Limitation	53
5.1.2	Analysis of the Claims	56
5.1.3	Claims Excluded from Limitation	64

Table of Contents

	5.1.4	Costs	70
7	5.2	The 1957 Limitation Convention	71
8	5.3	The 1924 Limitation Convention	72
9	5.4	The US Limitation of Liability Act	73
9			
10		Chapter 6	
11		When Is the Right to Limited Liability Lost?	75
12	6.1	Who Is the <i>Alter Ego</i> of the Shipowner?	76
13	6.2	The Misconduct That Leads to Loss of the Right to Limit	83
14	6.2.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs – Article 4	83
17	6.2.2	The 1924 Limitation Convention, Article 2 and the 1957 Limitation Convention, Article 1	90
	6.2.3	The US Position	91
19			
		Chapter 7	
		The Limits of Liability	93
21	7.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	93
21	7.1.1	Limits of Liability for Property Damage	95
23	7.1.2	Limits of Liability for Loss of Life and Personal Injury	95
23	7.1.2.1	Other Than Passenger Claims	95
24	7.1.2.2	Passenger Claims	96
	7.2	The 1957 Limitation Convention	99
	7.2.1	Property Damage	99
27	7.2.2	Loss of Life and Personal Injury	99
27	7.3	The 1924 Limitation Convention	100
27	7.3.1	Property Claims	100
	7.3.2	Loss of Life and Personal Injury Claims	102
41	7.4	The US Position	102
43	7.5	Limits of Liability for Loss of Life and Personal Injury Claims Under the Global Limitation Conventions	103
44	7.6	Limits of Liability for Damage Other Than Loss of Life and Personal Injury Under the Global Limitation Conventions	104
47	7.7	Passengers: Limits of Liability for Loss of Life and Personal Injury Under the Global Limitation Conventions	106
50	7.8	Limits of Liability for Towage: The Flotilla Problem	107
51			
51		Chapter 8	
		Multiple Funds, Multiplicity of Defendants and Counterclaims	111
53	8.1	Multiple Limitation Funds	111
53	8.2	Aggregation	114
53	8.2.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	114
56	8.2.2	The 1957 Limitation Convention	115
64	8.2.3	The 1924 Limitation Convention and the US Position	115

Table of Contents

8.3	Counterclaims	115
8.3.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	116
8.3.2	The 1924 and 1957 Limitation Conventions	116
8.3.3	The US Position	117
Chapter 9		
Constitution of the Fund and Priority of Claims		119
9.1	The 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	119
9.1.1	Where Can the Fund Be Constituted?	119
9.1.2	How Large Should the Limitation Fund Be and How Can It Be Established?	123
9.1.3	Which Claims Are Paid Out of the Limitation Fund?	125
9.1.4	Consequences of the Constitution of the Limitation Fund	128
9.1.5	Limitation of Liability without the Constitution of the Fund	132
9.2	The 1957 Limitation Convention	134
9.2.1	General	134
9.2.2	Where Can the Fund Be Constituted?	134
9.2.3	How Large Should the Limitation Fund Be?	135
9.2.4	Which Claims Are Paid Out of the Limitation Fund?	136
9.2.5	Consequences of the Constitution of the Limitation Fund	136
9.2.6	Limitation of Liability without the Constitution of the Fund	137
9.3	The 1924 Limitation Convention	137
9.4	The US Position	138
Chapter 10		
The Admiralty Jurisdiction of the English High Court and English Limitation Procedure		141
10.1	Introduction	141
10.2	Action <i>In Rem</i> and Arrest of Ships	143
10.2.1	General	143
10.2.2	Action <i>In Rem</i> to Arrest the 'Guilty' or 'Sister' Ship	144
10.2.3	Arrest under a Maritime Lien	146
10.3	Procedure for Claims <i>In Rem</i>	146
10.4	Action <i>In Rem</i> for Collisions	148
10.5	Limitation Actions	148
10.5.1	Commencing a Limitation Action	148
10.5.2	The Limitation Fund	150
10.6	Arrest and Limitation of Liability	151
10.7	Freezing Injunctions	153
10.8	Comparison: The US Position	154
Chapter 11		
Jurisdiction for Global Limitation of Liability Proceedings		157

Table of Contents

11.1	Introduction	157
11.2	An Outline of the Legal Framework for Establishing English Jurisdiction in General	158
11.3	The European Framework	161
11.3.1	Application of the Brussels Regulation	162
11.3.2	Outline of the Allocation of Jurisdiction	163
11.3.3	Recognition and Enforcement of Judgments under the Brussels Regulation	170
11.4	An Outline of Jurisdiction Outside the EU Framework	172
11.5	Anti-suit Injunctions	178
11.6	Limitation of Liability: An Overview of the Situations and Issues	180
11.7	Limitation of Liability as a Defence: Jurisdiction for Claims on the Merits	182
11.7.1	Limitation of Liability as a Defence	182
11.7.2	Declarations of Non-Liability	183
11.8	Jurisdiction for Limitation Proceedings	184
11.8.1	Jurisdiction for Limitation Proceedings Where a Claim on the Merits Has Not Been Commenced	184
11.8.1.1	The Position under the Brussels Regulation	184
11.8.1.2	The Position under English Common Law Principles	190
11.8.1.3	Availability of Anti-suit Injunctions	193
11.8.2	Jurisdictional Consequences of Commencing Limitation Proceedings after a Claim on the Merits Has Been Commenced	194
11.8.2.1	The Position under the Brussels Regulation	194
11.8.2.2	The Position under English Common Law Principles	198
11.8.3	Jurisdictional Consequences of Commencing a Claim on the Merits after Limitation Proceedings Have Been Commenced	200
11.9	Jurisdictional Issues Where a Judgment Or Decree on Limitation of Liability Has Been Granted	201
11.9.1	Foreign Limitation Decree Issued by a Court in an EU Member State	202
11.9.2	Foreign Limitation Decree Issued by a Court Not in an EU Member State	206
11.9.3	Limitation Decree Issued by an English Court	207
11.10	The Relationship between Limitation of Liability and the Applicable Law	207
11.10.1	English Law and Rome II	207
11.10.2	The US Position	211
Part III	Specific Liability Regimes Involving Limitation of Liability	213

Table of Contents

Chapter 12	
Passenger Liability	215
12.1 Introduction	215
12.2 Passenger Limitation of Liability Under the 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	217
12.3 The 1974 Athens Convention	218
12.3.1 Scope of Application	218
12.3.2 Liability Provisions	220
12.3.3 Alternative Claims against the Carrier	222
12.3.4 Time Bar	225
12.3.5 Limitation of Liability	226
12.3.5.1 Applicable Limits	226
12.3.5.2 Effect on Rights of Limitation of Liability Arising under Other International Regimes Including the 1996 LLMC	228
12.3.5.3 Loss of Life or Personal Injury	229
12.3.5.4 Property Damage	231
12.3.5.5 Loss of Right to Limit Liability	232
12.3.6 Jurisdictional Provisions	232
12.3.7 The Effect of Contractual Terms	234
12.4 The 2002 Athens Convention	234
12.4.1 Liability and Its Limitation	236
12.4.1.1 Loss of Life and Personal Injury	236
12.4.1.2 Damage to Luggage	237
12.4.2 Other Issues	238
12.4.3 Compulsory Insurance	238
12.4.4 Time Bar	239
12.4.5 Jurisdictional Issues	239
12.4.6 Amendments of the Limits of Liability	240
12.5 The 2002 Athens Convention and Its Interaction with the 1996 LLMC	240
12.6 Implementation Problems	241
12.7 EU Implementation	243
Chapter 13	
Cargo Claims and the Hague-Visby Rules	247
13.1 Introduction	247
13.2 Identity of the Carrier	249
13.3 The Hague-Visby Rules	250
13.3.1 Application of the Rules	250
13.3.2 The Legal Regime Introduced by the Hague-Visby Rules	252
13.3.2.1 Obligations of the Carrier	252
13.3.2.2 Protection of the Carrier	254
13.3.3 Limitation of Liability Under the Hague-Visby Rules	258
13.3.3.1 Amount of Limitation	258
13.3.4 Breaking the Limits Under the Hague-Visby Rules	261

Table of Contents

215	13.3.4.1	Article IV Rule 5(e)	261
215	13.3.4.2	Servants and Agents	266
217	13.3.4.3	Compulsory Effect of the Provisions of the Rules	267
218	13.3.5	Jurisdictional Issues	267
218	13.4	The Hague Rules	271
220	13.4.1	The Hague Rules	271
222	13.4.2	When Do the Hague Rules Apply?	271
225	13.4.3	The Evidentiary Value of the Bill of Lading Statements	273
226	13.4.4	Protection of the Carrier	273
226	13.4.5	The Hague Rules Time Bar	274
	13.4.6	Limitation of Liability under the Hague Rules	275
	13.4.6.1	Monetary Unit	276
228	13.4.6.2	The Meaning of 'Package Or Unit'	277
229	13.4.6.3	How Many Packages?	278
231	13.4.6.4	When Does the Carrier Lose the Right to Limit Liability?	280
232	13.5	Relationship with Global Limitation of Liability	281
232	13.6	The Hamburg Rules	282
234	13.6.1	Limitation Provisions	283
234	13.6.2	Jurisdictional Issues	284
236	13.7	The Rotterdam Rules	287
236	13.7.1	Limitation Provisions	288
237	13.7.2	Differences from the Hague-Visby Rules	291
238	13.7.3	Limits of Liability for Delay	292
238	13.7.4	When Is the Right to Limit Liability Lost?	293
239	13.7.5	Jurisdictional Questions	294
240			
	Chapter 14		
240		Limitation of Liability for Oil Pollution	295
241	14.1	Oil Pollution Liability from Tankers	296
243	14.2	Application of the Civil Liability Conventions	300
	14.3	Imposition of Liability	302
	14.3.1	What Types of Vessel Are Covered?	302
247	14.3.2	When Liability May Arise	304
247	14.3.3	Who Is Liable?	307
249	14.3.4	Exclusion of Liability	309
250	14.4	Limitation of Liability	311
250	14.4.1	Application of the Limitation Regime	311
252	14.4.2	Who May Limit Liability?	311
252	14.4.3	What Types of Vessel May Be Subject to Limitation of Liability?	312
254	14.4.4	The Limitation Amounts	312
258	14.4.5	When Does the Shipowner Lose the Right to Limit Liability?	313
261	14.5	The Shipowner's Limitation Fund	316

Table of Contents

14.6	Jurisdictional Issues	319
14.7	Overlap with the 1976 and 1996 LLMCs	320
14.8	Overlap with Other Limitation Regimes	321
14.9	The IOPC Fund 1992	323
14.9.1	Compensation by the IOPC Fund 1992	324
14.9.2	Time Bar	326
14.9.3	The Aggregate Amount of Compensation Payable by the IOPC Fund 1992	327
14.9.4	Jurisdiction for Actions under the IOPC Fund 1992 Convention	329
14.10	The Role of the IOPC Supplementary Fund	330
14.11	STOPIA 2006 and TOPIA 2006	331
14.12	Limits of Liability for Pollution Damage	333
Chapter 15		
Bunker and Lubricating Oils		
15.1	The 2001 BOPC	335
15.2	The Scope and Definitions of the Convention	335
15.3	Liability for Bunker Oil Pollution	337
15.4	Time Bar	338
15.5	Limitation of Liability	341
15.6	When Does the Owner Lose the Right to Limit Liability?	341
15.7	Direct Action against the Insurer	343
15.8	Jurisdiction and Enforcement of Judgments	344
Chapter 16		
Liability for Oil Pollution Not Covered by International Conventions		
16.1	Liability Under Section 154 of the MSA 1995	349
16.2	Oil Pollution Damage Under the 2004 Environmental Liability Directive	349
16.3	Non-persistent Oils	351
16.4	Spilled Oil as Waste	354
Chapter 17		
Hazardous and Noxious Substances		
17.1	Introduction	357
17.2	The 2010 HNS Protocol to the 1996 HNS Convention	357
17.3	2010 HNS Convention: Scope of Application	360
17.4	Which Ships Are Subject to the 2010 HNS Convention?	361
17.5	Damage Covered by the 2010 HNS Convention	362
17.6	Where Does the 2010 HNS Convention Apply?	363
17.7	2010 HNS Convention: Who Is Liable and When?	364
		365

Table of Contents

319	17.8	Type of Liability Imposed by the 2010 HNS Convention, Together with Exceptions to and Exemptions from Liability	366
320			
321	17.9	Insurance under the 2010 HNS Convention	367
323	17.10	2010 HNS Convention: Limitation of Liability	368
324	17.10.1	The Applicable Limits	368
326	17.10.2	Conduct Resulting in Loss of the Right to Limit Liability	369
327	17.11	Establishment and Distribution of the Limitation Fund under the 2010 HNS Convention	369
329	17.12	Time Bars and the 2010 HNS Convention	371
330	17.13	Jurisdictional Issues Arising from the 2010 HNS Convention	372
331			
333	17.14	The HNS Fund	374
	17.14.1	Time Bar	376
	17.14.2	Jurisdictional Issues	376
335	17.15	Obstacles to Ratification of the 1996 HNS Convention	378
335			
337	17.15.1	The HNS Accounts	378
338	17.15.2	The Definition of 'Receiver'	380
341	17.15.3	Reporting Obligations	381
341			
	Appendix I		
343	Ratification Status of the 1924 Limitation Convention		383
344			
344	Appendix II		
	Ratification Status of the 1957 Limitation Convention and its 1979 Protocol		385
	A.	States Applying the 1957 Limitation Convention	385
349	B.	States Applying the 1979 Protocol to the 1957 Limitation Convention	388
349			
351	Appendix III		
354	Ratification Status of the 1976 and 1996 LLMCs		389
354	A.	States Applying the 1976 LLMC	389
	B.	States Applying the 1996 LLMC	392
357	Appendix IV		
357	1924 Limitation Convention		395
360	Appendix V		
361	1957 Limitation Convention		403
362			
363	Appendix VI		
364	1976 LLMC		411
365			

Table of Contents

Appendix VII	
1996 LLMC	423
Bibliography	435
Websites	443
Index	445