

A Landscape of Contemporary Theories of International Law

By

Emmanuel Roucouas



**BRILL
NIJHOFF**

LEIDEN | BOSTON

WAL RIAHO IHORAS

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Roukounas, Emmanouël I., author.

Title: A landscape of contemporary theories of international law / by Emmanuel Roucounas.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill Nijhoff, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019001013 (print) | LCCN 2019001831 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004385368 (Ebook) | ISBN 9789004385351 (hardback : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: International law.

Classification: LCC KZ3410 (ebook) | LCC KZ3410 .R68 2019 (print) | DDC 341.01—dc23

LC record available at <http://lccn.loc.gov/2019001013>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISBN 978-90-04-38535-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-38536-8 (e-book)

Copyright 2019 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi, Brill Sense, Hotei Publishing, mentis Verlag, Verlag Ferdinand Schöningh and Wilhelm Fink Verlag.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Printed by Printforce, the Netherlands

Contents

Acknowledgments	XIII
List of Abbreviations	XIV
Preface: The Choir Group	XVI

PART I

Essential Elements

1	Introduction	3
1.1	Theories about Theory	3
1.2	Theories of or about International Law	11
2	Thoughts on the Impact of Theory on International Law	15
3	Important Elements in the Making of Theory	25
3.1	Ideology	25
3.2	Polysemy of Terms and Concepts: The Role of Language	29
3.3	Limits and Limitations of Theory	36
3.4	History and Histories of International Law	42
3.5	Methodology and Methods	48
3.6	International and Domestic Law: Incorporation, Transformation, Coordination, Order of Execution, Adaptation, Approximation, Fusion, Direct Effect, and Resistance	52
3.6.1	Subsidiarity	61
3.6.2	Inter-judicial Dialogue	63
3.6.3	Legal Pluralism from the Viewpoint of the Relationship between International and Domestic Law	65
3.7	International Legal Theory and Technical and Scientific Expertise	67
4	Adumbrations of the Theoretical Adventure	72
4.1	Some Characteristics	72
4.2	Difficulties in the Assortment of Theorists in Schools and Movements	77

- 5 **Traceability of Antecedents to Current Scholarship** 82
- 5.1 Introduction 82
 - 5.2 The Swing between the Two Mainstream Theories 82
 - 5.3 Natural Law 83
 - 5.4 Positivism(s) 84
 - 5.5 Responses to Traditional Voluntarist Positivism 86
 - 5.6 Normativism (a System Governed by Legal Norms) 87
 - 5.7 Aspects of the Sociological Underpinnings of International Law 91
 - 5.7.1 *European Scholarship with "Sociological" Inspiration* 92
 - 5.7.2 *American "Exceptionalism"* 94
 - 5.7.3 *Singularities of the Soviet Doctrine (1922–1989)* 97
- 6 **Regional and National Traditions: Prolegomena to the Present (from the End of the Second World War to the 1970s)** 100
- 6.1 Introduction 100
 - 6.2 Overview of Theories after the Second World War 101
 - 6.2.1 *Europe* 101
 - 6.2.2 *United States. Traditional, but also "What Seems Almost Evident [Is] the Difference between You and Me"* 119
 - 6.2.3 *Latin America* 121
 - 6.2.4 *Africa* 122
 - 6.2.5 *Asia* 125
- 7 **Self-Referential International Law and the Compelling Need to Also Listen to Others' Voices** 133
- 8 **Concluding Remarks** 137

PART 2

Enduring and New Schools, Movements and Trends

- 9 **Introduction** 141
- 10 **Basic Orientations** 145
- 10.1 The Liberal Agendas 145
 - 10.2 The Positivist Stronghold 152
 - 10.3 Renovated, Expressly Stated, Hidden or Inherited Naturalism 158
 - 10.4 Realism 162

- 10.5 Idealism 169
- 10.6 Rationalism and Rationality 171
- 10.7 Pragmatism 175
- 10.8 Empiricism 178
- 10.9 Formalism 181
- 11 **Other Approaches** 184
 - 11.1 Modernity, Modernism and Post-modernism 184
 - 11.2 Policy-Oriented Theory, Perspective or Jurisprudence 187
 - 11.3 Structuralism and Post-structuralism 190
 - 11.4 Constructivism 193
 - 11.5 Deconstruction 197
 - 11.6 Critical International Legal Studies 199
 - 11.7 Third World Approaches to International Law (TWAAIL) 204
 - 11.8 The Feminist Presence 207
 - 11.9 Functionalism and Institutionalism 209
 - 11.9.1 *Functionalism* 209
 - 11.9.2 *Institutionalism in Its Double Sense* 212
 - 11.10 Instrumentalism 215
 - 11.11 International Regime Theories 217
- 12 **Universal, Plural, Relative** 220
 - 12.1 Legal Cosmopolitanism 220
 - 12.2 Constitutionalism and the "Constitutionalization" of International Law 224
 - 12.3 Legal Pluralism 229
 - 12.4 Legal Relativism and Relativity 234
 - 12.5 Role Splitting 239
- 13 **Further Explorations** 241
 - 13.1 Law and Economics or Rational Choice Approaches to International Law 241
 - 13.2 General Systems Theory (GST) or Systemic Theory (ST) 244
 - 13.3 A Place for Chaos Theory 251
 - 13.4 Current Marxist, Neo-Marxist and Leninist Approaches 254
 - 13.5 Moving in a "Middle Road" 256
- 14 **Sociological Aspects of International Law Theories** 258
- 15 **Concluding Remarks** 261

PART 3***Connecting More Writings to Theory*****SECTION 1*****The International Legal System: Important Issues***

- 16 Where is the International Community or Society? 267**
 - 16.1 Evolving Views 267
- 17 Ontological and Post-ontological Discourses 274**
 - 17.1 "International Law as Law" 274
 - 17.2 Mature or Primitive Law 280
 - 17.3 Discontent 281
 - 17.4 Law and Crisis 282
- 18 General (or Grand) Theories of International Law and General International Law 286**
 - 18.1 In Search of a Current Specimen of General Theory 286
 - 18.2 General International Law: The Parameters 288
- 19 Legal Basis of International Obligations 293**
- 20 Legitimacy 299**
- 21 Compliance 305**
- 22 Unity and Universality 312**
 - 22.1 Unity 312
 - 22.2 Universality 316
- 23 Fragmentation 323**
 - 23.1 Siblings of Fragmentation: Self-contained or Special Regimes 331
 - 23.2 Cohesion of Special Regimes or Subsystems 334
- 24 The Issue of Jurisdiction and Competence 336**
- 25 Fictions 340**
- 26 Hegemonic Power and Unilateralism 343**

- 27 The International Dimension of the Rule of Law 348
- 28 Normativity Forming an Integral Part of International Law 354
- 28.1 The Safe Port of Human Rights 354
- 28.2 Non-use and Use of Force 371
- 28.3 International Humanitarian Law (IHL) 394
- 28.4 The Economy: No More a Passing Silhouette 409
- 29 Concluding Remarks 423

SECTION 2

Flashes about the Addressees, the Fabrication and Operation of International Law

A

The Addressees of International Law

- 30 The "Users" of International Law: Moving beyond Doctrinal Controversies on "Subjects", "Non-State Actors" and "Participants" 427
- 31 The State 434
- 31.1 The Concept 434
- 31.2 Creation and Recognition 435
- 31.3 Sovereignty 438
- 31.4 International Legal Personality 445
- 31.5 Equality 448
- 31.6 Territory 451
- 31.7 State Immunity/Immunities 453
- 31.8 Responsibility 459
- 31.9 Liability 470
- 31.10 Self-determination 473
- 31.11 Secession 476
- 31.12 Succession 481
- 31.13 Statehood and "One Size Fits All" Approaches 485
- 32 International Organizations 489
- 32.1 Role and Legal Status 489
- 32.2 Responsibility and Accountability of International Organizations. A Story of Loopholes 499

- 33 "Individuals" and Other Private Persons 511
- 33.1 An Unfinished Symphony 511
- 33.2 Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and the International Civil Society 517

B

Aspects of the Fabrication and Operation of International Law

- 34 Law-Making 525
- 34.1 Producers 525
- 34.2 Main Products and Modes of Fabrication 536
- 34.2.1 Customary International Law 542
- 34.2.2 Treaties 557
- 34.2.3 General Principles of Law 568
- 35 Expanding the Products and Modes of Fabrication 575
- 35.1 Soft Law 575
- 35.2 Standards 580
- 35.3 A Converging Category: Transnational Law 581
- 36 Relationship between Norms 584
- 36.1 Hierarchy of Norms 584
- 36.2 The Intertwined Duo of *Jus Cogens* and Obligations *Erga Omnes* 586
- 36.2.1 *Jus Cogens* 587
- 36.2.2 Obligations *Erga Omnes* 592
- 36.3 Successive, Parallel and Contradictory Commitments. The Issue of Transtextuality 596
- 37 Interpretation 600
- 38 Concluding Remarks 614

SECTION 3

Widening the Discourse

- 39 Interrogations and Expectations 619
- 39.1 Progress and "Progressive Development" 619
- 39.2 Democracy 625

39.3	The Eternal Quest for Ethics and Morality	629
39.4	Fluctuations on Justice Stemming from International Law	637
39.5	Globalization	640
39.6	Governance and Global Administrative Law	643
39.7	International Law and Politics	648
39.8	International Environmental Law	653
40	A Skeleton Meeting of Minds	661
40.1	Attempts for a Dialogue between International Law and International Relations (IR) Theories	661
40.2	General Theories of Law and Political Science Touching on International Law	665
40.2.1	<i>General Theories of Law</i>	666
40.2.2	<i>Other Doctrines Addressing Questions Related to International Law</i>	673
41	Concluding Remarks	682
42	Final Conclusions: The Choristers' Performances	684
	Index of Authors	689
	Index of Subjects	702