

International Law and Boundary Disputes in Africa

Gbenga Oduntan

 **Routledge**
Taylor & Francis Group
LONDON AND NEW YORK

190

First published 2015
by Routledge
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon, OX14 4RN

and by Routledge
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa business

© 2015 Gbenga Oduntan

The right of Gbenga Oduntan to be identified as author of this work has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical, or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Trademark notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation without intent to infringe.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A catalog record has been requested for this book

ISBN: 978-0-415-83892-4 (hbk)
ISBN: 978-0-203-77684-1 (ebk)

Typeset in Baskerville by
Keystroke, Station Road, Codsall, Wolverhampton



Printed and bound by CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xvii
Introduction	1
1 Africa: Birthing the empire of law and concept of territory	6
1.1 <i>International law and Africa</i>	8
1.1.1 Racialism and European appropriation of the 'common law of mankind'	9
1.1.2 Why the House always wins	14
1.2 <i>Eurocentricity and the applicable international boundary laws</i>	16
2 Sovereignty, jurisdiction, territorial integrity and territorial acquisition in international law	23
2.1 <i>Concept and forms of sovereignty</i>	23
2.2 <i>Globalisation vs territorial sovereignty</i>	27
2.3 <i>Jurisdiction within sovereignty</i>	31
2.4 <i>Westphalian vs indigenous sovereignty</i>	33
2.5 <i>The principle of territorial jurisdiction</i>	36
2.6 <i>Territory and territorial acquisition in public international law and international relations</i>	38
2.6.1 Occupation	42
2.6.2 Cession	43
2.6.3 Accretion, erosion and avulsion	44
2.6.4 Conquest or annexation	44
2.6.5 Prescription	45
2.6.6 Renunciation or relinquishment	46
2.6.7 Adjudication	46
2.6.8 Abandonment and dereliction	46
2.6.9 Discovery	46
2.6.10 Papal grant	47

3	Frontiers and boundaries in the context of international legal framework of territorial sovereignty and jurisdiction	50
3.1	<i>The functionality of frontiers and boundaries</i>	50
3.2	<i>Natural vs artificial boundaries</i>	52
3.3	<i>Frontier vs boundary</i>	53
4	Province of international boundary disputes determined	55
4.1	<i>What are international boundary disputes?</i>	55
4.2	<i>Internal boundary disputes</i>	63
4.3	<i>Territorial vs boundary disputes</i>	65
4.4	<i>Frontiers, borders, fences and walls in law and international relations</i>	69
4.4.1	Boundaries	69
4.4.2	Borders and borderlands	73
4.4.3	Fences and walls	75
4.5	<i>Delimitation and demarcation juxtaposed</i>	78
4.6	<i>African delimitation and demarcation of boundaries in their historical, colonial and contemporary contexts</i>	79
4.7	<i>High power politics: legality and illegalities of the Berlin Conference (1885)</i>	88
4.8	<i>Classifications and nature of African boundary disputes</i>	90
4.9	<i>Boundaries and disputes: a multidisciplinary approach</i>	96
5	Actual and potential role of the African Union Organisation in boundary dispute management and resolution	102
5.1	<i>African Union early warning system</i>	105
5.2	<i>The African Union Border Programme (AUBP) and the delimitation, demarcation and settlement of African boundary disputes</i>	108
5.2.1	Law practice and diplomacy of the African Union Border Programme	109
5.2.2	Implementation of the African Union Border Programme	118
6	African regional economic communities and the management of boundary disputes	126
6.1	<i>Conflict resolution and management in the East African sub-region (IGAD area)</i>	127
6.1.1	Role of CEWARN in detecting and managing cross-boundary disputes	127
6.1.2	IGAD's relevance in border and boundary disputes	128
6.2	<i>ECOWAS</i>	131
6.2.1	Conflict resolution and management in the West African sub-region: ECOWAS area	133

6.2.2	Rules of the ECOWAS Treaty and Protocols	134
6.2.3	Actual and potential role of the Court of Justice of the Economic Community of West African States	140
6.2.4	ECOWAS Early Warning System	141
6.2.5	ECOWAS experience in boundary disputes	142
6.3	<i>Conflict and dispute management in the Economic Community of Central African States (ECCAS)</i>	143
6.3.1	Assessing the early warning capabilities and performance of MARAC	148
6.4	<i>Law and practice of conflict and dispute management in the SADC</i>	149
6.4.1	Political mechanisms for the resolution of boundary disputes in the SADC region	150
7	Manifestations of boundary disputes in the African geopolitical zones	155
7.1	<i>East African boundaries: border disputes</i>	156
7.1.1	Sudan–Kenya: the Ilemi Triangle	157
7.1.2	Kenya–South Sudan (Nadapal boundary)	158
7.1.3	Tanzania–Malawi: Lake Malawi (Nyasa)	159
7.1.4	Kenya–Uganda: Migingo Island	159
7.1.5	Eritrea–Ethiopia	160
7.1.6	Sudan–South Sudan border disputes	162
7.2	<i>West African boundaries and borders disputes</i>	164
7.2.1	Cameroon–Nigeria: land and maritime dispute	166
7.2.2	Gabon and Equatorial Guinea: territorial disputes on the Island of Mbanié	168
7.2.3	Burkina Faso–Niger frontier dispute	168
7.2.4	Benin–Niger frontier dispute	169
7.3	<i>North Africa: boundary disputes and contested territories</i>	170
7.4	<i>Southern Africa: boundary disputes and contested territories</i>	171
7.4.1	Swaziland–South Africa	173
7.5	<i>Central African states (CEMAC): boundary disputes</i>	176
8	Case study: the arbitral route to settlement of African boundary disputes	177
8.1	<i>The arbitral route: the Eritrea–Ethiopia Boundary Commission Case</i>	177
8.1.1	Synopsis of the Eritrean Case: statement submitted to the EEBC	178
8.2	<i>Synopsis of Ethiopia’s statement in accordance with paragraph 4(8) of the Agreement concluded on 12 December 2000</i>	184
8.2.1	Ethiopia’s historical account of the background of the territory	184

xii Contents

- 8.2.2 Ethiopian view of applicable law 185
- 8.2.3 Ethiopian view of the methodology: the five sectors 186
- 8.2.4 The Agreements pre-figuring the Treaties of 1900, 1902 and 1908 187
- 8.2.5 Ethiopian view of the pertinent geography 190
- 8.2.6 Ethiopian view of the changing and opportunistic attitude of Italy during key periods 190
- 8.2.7 Ethiopia's position 190
- 8.2.8 The disposition of the Cunama (Sector II) 191
- 8.2.9 Interpretation and application of the Agreements: Sector III – along the Mareb River from the Mai Ambessa to the Belesa River 191
- 8.2.10 Interpretation and application of the Agreements: Sector V – from the confluence of the Mareb and Belesa Rivers to the easternmost point defined by the Treaty of 1900 192
- 8.2.11 Ethiopian view of the period 1908–present 192
- 8.2.12 Incidence of disputes between the parties 194
- 8.3 *Critiquing the EEBC decision and understanding the difficulties of implementation* 195
- 8.4 *Eritrea–Ethiopia Claims Commission (EECC)* 203

- 9 Case study: mediation route to settlement: the dispute between Malawi and Tanzania over Lake Nyasa** 206
 - 9.1 *The applicable treaties and instruments* 208
 - 9.2 *Malawi's position* 209
 - 9.3 *Tanzania's position* 211
 - 9.4 *HLMT: challenges, achievements and prospects* 214

- 10 Case study: adjudicative route – a critique of the land and maritime boundary dispute (*Cameroon v Nigeria*)** 218
 - 10.1 *Geophysical setting of the region* 219
 - 10.2 *Historical provenance of the boundary and territorial problem* 220
 - 10.3 *The Judgment* 223
 - 10.4 *The law and diplomacy of the Cameroon–Nigeria Mixed Commission* 227
 - 10.5 *The structures of diplomacy, administration and implementation* 232
 - 10.6 *Identifying Eurocentricity in the jurisprudence of the World Court* 235

- 11 Sociology, politics, insecurity and the psychology of power in African boundary relations** 240
 - 11.1 *Power and political differentials in the diplomacy of African boundary disputes* 246

12 Pacific settlement of international boundary disputes: a critical appraisal of the International Court of Justice	251
12.1 <i>Conflict resolution and cooling off mechanism functions of the ICJ in the adjudication of African boundary disputes</i>	251
12.1.1 Diplomatic function of international courts	253
12.1.2 Advancing jurisprudence and elaboration of the law	254
12.2 <i>International adjudication of African boundary disputes: a critical appraisal of the contentious and advisory jurisdiction of the World Court</i>	257
12.3 <i>Role of the International Court of Justice in relation to the struggle for self-determination and independence for the mandate and colonial territories in Africa</i>	262
12.4 <i>Prospects of the African Court of Justice as a preferred option under the adjudication route</i>	266
12.5 <i>International arbitration of African boundary disputes: a critical appraisal of the Permanent Court of Arbitration</i>	267
12.5.1 Arbitration	267
12.5.2 The Hague Conferences and the Permanent Court of Arbitration	270
12.6 <i>Evaluation of alternative forms of pacific settlement of boundary disputes</i>	279
12.6.1 Negotiation	283
12.6.2 Enquiry	286
12.6.3 Conciliation	287
12.6.4 Good Offices	289
12.6.5 Mediation	291
12.7 <i>Multi-tracking and indigenising settlement of boundary disputes in Africa: a fusion of law, politics and culture</i>	295
12.7.1 Bona fide assisted direct negotiations	298
12.7.2 African mediation	299
12.7.3 The African Conciliation Commission	300
12.7.4 The underdeveloped state of indigenous African adjudication	300
12.8 <i>Factors predictive of the failure of ADR and Tier 2 diplomacy in boundary matters</i>	306
12.8.1 Poor knowledge, incompetence or careless diagnosis of the crisis	306
12.8.2 Poor strategy and/or poorly trained mediators	307
12.8.3 Lack of neutrality/mediators with an interest to serve	307
12.8.4 Unable to stay the course	308
12.9 <i>Identification and evaluation of best practices for pacific settlement of disputes</i>	308
12.9.1 Flexibility	309
12.9.2 Visit to locus	309

12.9.3	Determination of <i>locus standi</i>	311
12.9.4	The interpretative function in boundary dispute resolution	312
12.9.5	Interim measures of protection and control	313
13	Role and scope for involvement of Africa's developed northern partners in the settlement of boundary disputes	316
13.1	<i>Role and scope of involvement of the European Union in African boundary dispute resolution</i>	316
13.2	<i>Role and scope of involvement of the United States in African boundary dispute resolution</i>	317
14	The problem of costs and the relevance of legal aid in African boundary dispute resolution: funding delimitation, demarcation and other implementation activities	319
15	Settlement of international boundary disputes by use of force	324
15.1	<i>Retorsion, retaliation and war</i>	326
16	Re-evaluation of the <i>uti possidetis</i> principle in light of the African experience	330
16.1	<i>Uti possidetis in Africa: a problematic doctrine?</i>	330
16.2	<i>Uti possidetis within the equation of political separation and self-determination</i>	337
17	Strategies and modalities to resolve straddling communities and resources under the African Union Boundary Programme	350
17.1	<i>Boundary demarcation and the problem of straddling communities and enclaves</i>	350
17.2	<i>Varying demarcation in the interest of justice and accommodating losers' interests</i>	357
17.2.1	<i>Straddling resources and hydrocarbon fields</i>	357
17.2.2	<i>Straddling fisheries</i>	359
17.3	<i>Recognising an African customary rule in favour of sharing straddling resources</i>	360
18	Alternative futures: strategies of negotiation and innovative methods to avoid deadlock in relation to territorial conflicts	363
18.1	<i>Special territorial arrangements</i>	364
18.2	<i>Sale and purchase of territory</i>	365

- 18.3 *The establishment of free cities* 365
- 18.4 *Lease back options* 366
- 18.5 *Cession* 367
- 18.6 *Appropriate recourse to the use of plebiscites* 367
- 18.7 *Afrocentric solutions to the problems of delimitation and demarcation* 369

19 Resolution of international boundary disputes involving African nations: alternative futures and general conclusions 371

- Appendix I* 389
- Appendix II* 391
- Appendix III* 392
- Appendix IV* 398
- Appendix V* 400
- Index* 403