

The Continental Shelf Beyond 200 Nautical Miles

Delineation, Delimitation and Dispute Settlement

By

Bjarni Már Magnússon

Dedicated to Hrefna Magnúsdóttir and Hrafnhildur

193



SARCHI CHAIR LAW

**BRILL
NIJHOFF**

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Magnússon, Bjarni Már, author.

The continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles : delineation, delimitation and dispute settlement / Bjarni Mar Magnusson.

pages cm. — (Publications on ocean development ; v. 78)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-29683-1 (hardback : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-90-04-29684-8 (e-book)

1. Continental shelf—Measurement. 2. United Nations. Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf. 3. Territorial waters. 4. Jurisdiction, Territorial. I. Title.

KZA1660.M34 2015

341.4'5—dc23

201500940

This publication has been typeset in the multilingual 'Brill' typeface. With over 5,100 characters covering Latin, IPA, Greek, and Cyrillic, this typeface is especially suitable for use in the humanities. For more information, please see brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0924-1922

ISBN 978-90-04-29683-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-29684-8 (e-book)

Copyright 2015 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi and Hotei Publishing.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Contents

Acknowledgements	XI
Abbreviations	XII
1 Introduction	1
1.1 The Topic	1
1.2 The Approach	4
1.3 Outline of the Study	5
2 The Outer Limits of the Continental Shelf	7
2.1 Introduction	7
2.2 What is the Continental Shelf?	7
2.3 The Establishment of the Outer Limits of the Continental Shelf	
Beyond 200 Nautical Miles	9
2.3.1 <i>The History of the Legal Continental Shelf 1945–82</i>	9
2.3.2 <i>Natural Prolongation</i>	14
2.3.3 <i>UNCLOS Provisions on the Establishment of the Outer Limits of the Continental Shelf</i>	17
2.3.4 <i>Coastal States' Rights and Duties in the Continental Shelf</i>	36
2.4 Concluding Remarks	39
3 The Role of the CLCS	40
3.1 Introduction	40
3.2 Legal Instruments	41
3.3 What is the CLCS?	45
3.3.1 <i>What is the Role of the CLCS?</i>	45
3.3.2 <i>Who are the Members of the CLCS?</i>	53
3.3.3 <i>What Kind of Entity is the CLCS?</i>	58
3.3.4 <i>Does the CLCS Represent the International Community?</i>	62
3.3.5 <i>The Commission's Connections to other International Entities</i>	63
3.4 Recommendations and Resubmissions	68
3.4.1 <i>Introduction</i>	68
3.4.2 <i>Main Aspects of the Procedure</i>	69
3.4.3 <i>Adopted Recommendations and Resubmissions</i>	75
3.5 Four Fundamental Issues of Interpretation	80
3.5.1 <i>Are States Obligated to Make a Submission to the CLCS?</i>	80
3.5.2 <i>Can a Non-party to UNCLOS Make a Submission to the CLCS?</i>	82

- 3.5.3 *What does 'on the basis' mean?* 87
- 3.5.4 *What does 'final and binding' mean?* 91
- 3.6 The CLCS, Maritime Boundary Delimitations and Unresolved Land and Maritime Disputes 95
 - 3.6.1 *What is not the Role of the CLCS?* 95
 - 3.6.2 *What is a Dispute?* 102
 - 3.6.3 *Third Parties* 105
 - 3.6.4 *Partial Submissions* 107
 - 3.6.5 *Joint and Separate Submissions* 110
- 3.7 Concluding Remarks 116
- 4 Delimitation of the Continental Shelf Beyond 200 nm—The Method** 117
 - 4.1 Introduction 117
 - 4.2 The Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Adjacent or Opposite Coastal States 118
 - 4.2.1 *The Drawing of a Line* 118
 - 4.2.2 *An Agreement on the Basis of International Law* 125
 - 4.2.3 *Equitable Principles and Equidistance* 127
 - 4.2.4 *The Development of Continental Shelf Delimitations* 130
 - 4.2.5 *The Difference between Delineation and Delimitation* 135
 - 4.3 Is There an Inner and Outer Continental Shelf in Maritime Boundary Delimitations? 136
 - 4.4 The Difference between Negotiation and Adjudication in Maritime Boundary Delimitations 138
 - 4.5 Is the Equidistance/Relevant Circumstances Method Applicable in Delimitation Cases Regarding the Outer Continental Shelf? 142
 - 4.5.1 *The Method* 142
 - 4.5.2 *Entitlement* 146
 - 4.5.3 *Relevant Coastal Segments* 149
 - 4.5.4 *The First Step—A Provisional Equidistance Line* 150
 - 4.5.5 *The Second Step—Relevant Circumstances* 159
 - 4.5.6 *The Principle of Non-encroachment* 173
 - 4.5.7 *The Third Step—Proportionality* 177
 - 4.6 Defining the Terminus of an Outer Continental Shelf Boundary 180
 - 4.7 The 'Grey Area' Problem 182
 - 4.8 Outer Continental Shelf Boundary Agreements 185
 - 4.8.1 *Introduction* 185
 - 4.8.2 *State Practice* 187
 - 4.8.3 *Trends in State Practice* 208
 - 4.9 Concluding Remarks 212

5	The Role of International Courts and Tribunals in Outer Continental Shelf Disputes	214
5.1	Introduction	214
5.2	The Settlement of Disputes	215
5.2.1	<i>Introduction</i>	215
5.2.2	<i>The Main Dispute Settlement Provisions of UNCLOS</i>	217
5.2.3	<i>The Law-making Role of International Courts and Tribunals</i>	225
5.2.4	<i>The Optional Exception Clause</i>	227
5.2.5	<i>Standing</i>	235
5.2.6	<i>Entitlement Disputes Prior CLCS Recommendations</i>	246
5.2.7	<i>Are States Obligated to Wait for Recommendations from the CLCS before They Seek to Delimit the Outer Continental Shelf with Neighbouring States?</i>	247
5.3	The Evaluation of Scientific and Technical Evidence by International Courts and Tribunals	260
5.3.1	<i>Introduction</i>	260
5.3.2	<i>What is Scientific and Technical Evidence?</i>	260
5.3.3	<i>Scientific and Technical Complexity as a Non-jurisdictional Bar</i>	261
5.3.4	<i>Procedural Methods to Deal with Scientific and Technical Evidence</i>	262
5.3.5	<i>The Depth of Judicial Assessment of Scientific and Technical Findings of the CLCS</i>	270
5.3.6	<i>Can an International Court or Tribunal Cope with Complex Scientific and Technical Data?</i>	272
5.4	The Consequences of a Judgement for the CLCS	274
5.5	Concluding Remarks	276
6	Conclusions	278
	Table of Principal Treaties and Instruments	283
	Bibliography	288
	Index	312