

The International Seabed Authority and the Precautionary Principle

*Balancing Deep Seabed Mineral Mining and Marine
Environmental Protection*

By

Aline L. Jaeckel



BRILL
NIJHOFF
LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Jaeckel, Aline L., author.

Title: The international seabed authority and the pre-cautionary principle :
balancing deep seabed mineral mining and marine environmental protection /
By Aline L. Jaeckel.

Description: Boston : Brill Nijhoff, 2017. | Series: Publications on ocean
development ; Volume 83 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016044639 (print) | LCCN 2016044703 (ebook) | ISBN
9789004332270 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9789004332287 (e-book)

Subjects: LCSH: International Seabed Authority. | Ocean mining—Law and
legislation. | Ocean bottom—Law and legislation. | Marine resources
conservation—Law and legislation. | Marine pollution—Law and legislation
| Environmental law, International.

Classification: LCC KZ A1400 .J 34 2017 (print) | LCC KZ A1400 (ebook) | DDC
343.07/709162—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2016044639>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 0924-1922

ISBN 978-90-04-33227-0 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-33228-7 (e-book)

Copyright 2017 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi and
Hotei Publishing.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system,
or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise,
without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided
that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive,
Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Printed by Printforce, the Netherlands

Contents

Acknowledgements	XI
List of Figures	XII
List of Abbreviations	XIII
List of Cases	XVI
List of Treaties and Declarations	XVIII

PART I

Context—Deep Seabed Mining, the Marine Environment, and Precaution

1	Deep Seabed Mining and the Marine Environment	3
1.1	Setting the Scene: The Onset of Deep Seabed Mining	3
1.2	Exploring the Problem	7
1.2.1	<i>The Marine Environment of the Deep Seabed and its Mineral Resources</i>	7
1.2.2	<i>The Environmental Risks and Uncertainties of Deep Seabed Mineral Mining</i>	11
1.2.3	<i>The Need for a Precautionary Approach to Seabed Mining</i>	14
1.3	Objectives of the Study	18
1.4	Terminology	20
1.5	Methodology and Limits of the Study	22
1.6	Structure of the Study	24
2	The Precautionary Principle in International Law	27
2.1	Introduction	27
2.2	The Precautionary Principle in International Law	29
2.2.1	<i>From Reactive to Proactive Thinking: The Rationale of Precaution</i>	29
2.2.2	<i>History of the Precautionary Principle</i>	30
2.2.3	<i>Status of the Precautionary Principle in International Law</i>	33
2.2.4	<i>Overlapping Principles: Precaution and Prevention</i>	35
2.3	Defining the Precautionary Principle: Three Elements	37
2.3.1	<i>Threat of Environmental Harm</i>	37
2.3.2	<i>Uncertainty</i>	38

- 2.3.3 *Remedial Action* 39
 - 2.3.3.1 Effectiveness 39
 - 2.3.3.2 Proportionality 41
- 2.3.4 *The Role of Thresholds* 43
- 2.4 Implementing the Precautionary Principle 43
 - 2.4.1 *The Three Dimensions of Implementing Precaution* 43
 - 2.4.1.1 Institutional Dimension 44
 - 2.4.1.2 Procedural Dimension 44
 - 2.4.1.3 Protective Measures 47
 - 2.4.1.4 A Three-dimensional Assessment of the Implementation of Precaution 48
 - 2.4.2 *The Role of Values* 48
 - 2.4.2.1 Making Uncertainties Explicit 49
 - 2.4.2.2 Participation 50
 - 2.4.2.3 Transparency 51
 - 2.4.2.4 A Normative Framework 52
 - 2.4.3 *The Burden of Proof* 54
 - 2.4.3.1 Considerations for a General Allocation of the Burden of Proof 55
 - 2.4.3.2 Reversing the Burden of Proof as an Implementation Measure 56
 - 2.4.4 *The Nature of Uncertainties* 57
 - 2.4.5 *Dealing with Uncertainty in Complex Systems: Adaptive Management* 58
 - 2.4.6 *Examining Counter-Effects: the Aim of Net Environmental Protection* 61
 - 2.4.7 *Socio-Economic Considerations* 63
- 2.5 Framework for Analysing the Implementation of Precaution: Assessment Criteria 66

PART 2

The International Seabed Authority

- 3 The International Seabed Authority and the Seabed Mining Regime 73
 - 3.1 Introduction 73
 - 3.2 Historical Development of the Deep Seabed Mining Regime 74
 - 3.2.1 *The Legal Status of the International Seabed and its Resources* 74
 - 3.2.2 *The LOSC and Continuing Uncertainty as to the Legal Status of the Seabed and its Resources* 81

- 3.2.3 *The 1994 Implementing Agreement and the Revision of the Common Heritage Concept* 84
- 3.3 Mandate of the ISA 88
- 3.4 Institutional Organisation of the ISA 90
 - 3.4.1 *The Assembly* 92
 - 3.4.2 *The Council* 93
 - 3.4.3 *The Secretariat* 95
 - 3.4.4 *The Legal and Technical Commission* 96
 - 3.4.5 *The Economic Planning Commission* 98
 - 3.4.6 *The Finance Committee* 98
 - 3.4.7 *The Enterprise* 99
- 3.5 Decision-making Processes of the ISA 100
 - 3.5.1 *Adopting Mining Regulations* 101
 - 3.5.2 *Assessing Applications for Plans of Work* 103
- 3.6 Enforcement Powers 106
 - 3.6.1 *Monitoring Compliance* 106
 - 3.6.2 *Responsibilities and Liability* 108
- 3.7 Financing the ISA 110
- 3.8 Dispute Settlement in the ISA Regime: The Seabed Disputes Chamber 111
- 3.9 Conclusion 113
- 4 The Environmental Mandate of the ISA 116
 - 4.1 Introduction 116
 - 4.2 Environmental Considerations During the Negotiations of Part XI and the Implementing Agreement 117
 - 4.3 The General Obligation Under the Convention and the Implementing Agreement to Protect and Preserve the Marine Environment 121
 - 4.3.1 *The Obligation to Protect and Preserve the Marine Environment* 121
 - 4.3.2 *The Environmental Mandate of the ISA* 123
 - 4.3.3 *General Environmental Obligations of States* 127
 - 4.4 Gradual Integration of Precaution into the LOSC 131
 - 4.5 The Debate about Bioprospecting and Marine Scientific Research in the Context of the ISA's Mandate 136
 - 4.6 Conclusion 141
- 5 Developing the ISA's Environmental Mandate Through the Mining Code 142
 - 5.1 Introduction 142
 - 5.2 Law-making Powers of the ISA 143

- 5-3 The Mining Code 148
 - 5-3.1 *Exploration Regulations* 149
 - 5-3.2 *LTC Recommendations* 150
 - 5-3.3 *Future Exploitation Regulations* 152
- 5-4 The ISA's Environmental Obligations as Developed by the Mining Code 154
 - 5-4.1 *Assess and Monitor Environmental Impacts* 157
 - 5-4.1.1 Environmental Baselines 157
 - 5-4.1.2 Environmental Impact Assessments 159
 - 5-4.1.3 Monitoring Effects on the Marine Environment 164
 - 5-4.2 *Marine Protected Areas* 166
 - 5-4.2.1 Marine Protected Areas in Areas Beyond National Jurisdiction 167
 - 5-4.2.2 Mandate of the ISA to Declare Marine Protected Areas 169
 - 5-4.3 *Best Environmental Practices* 173
 - 5-4.4 *Emergency Orders* 174
 - 5-4.5 *Enforcement and Liability* 175
 - 5-4.6 *Applying a Precautionary Approach* 176
 - 5-4.6.1 Precautionary Thresholds in the ISA Context 179
- 5-5 Conclusion 187

PART 3

Implementing Precaution by the International Seabed Authority

- 6 Implementing the Precautionary Principle: Protective Measures 193
 - 6.1 Introduction 193
 - 6.2 Marine Scientific Research 195
 - 6.2.1 *Research Regarding Faunal Diversity Associated with Polymetallic Nodules* 195
 - 6.2.2 *Research Regarding Ecosystems Associated with Polymetallic Sulphides and Ferromanganese Crusts* 196
 - 6.2.3 *Discussion About the ISA's Engagement in Marine Scientific Research* 199
 - 6.3 Marine Protected Areas 201
 - 6.3.1 *The Environmental Management Plan for the Clarion-Clipperton Zone* 202
 - 6.3.2 *Environmental Management Plans for Other Areas?* 209

- 6.3.3 *Multi-Purpose Marine Protected Areas* 210
- 6.3.4 *Preservation Reference Zones* 211
- 6.3.5 *Safety Margins* 214
- 6.4 *Measures Pertaining to Particularly Vulnerable Ecosystems* 215
- 6.5 *Listing of Particular Activities* 219
- 6.6 *Emergency Orders* 220
- 6.7 *Environmental Restoration* 221
- 6.8 *Conclusion* 224

- 7 **Implementing the Precautionary Principle: Procedural Elements** 228
 - 7.1 *Introduction* 228
 - 7.2 *Assessing Risks and Uncertainties ...* 230
 - 7.2.1 *... through Strategic Environmental Assessment* 231
 - 7.2.2 *... in the Context of Assessing New Applications for Exploration Contracts* 236
 - 7.2.3 *... through Environmental Impact Assessments During Exploration Work* 240
 - 7.2.3.1 *The Lack of Environmental Baselines* 243
 - 7.2.3.2 *Procedural Consequences of Environmental Impact Assessments* 247
 - 7.2.4 *Bringing Environmental Impact Assessments in Line with the Precautionary Approach—Some Suggestions* 249
 - 7.3 *Amending Environmental Standards* 251
 - 7.3.1 *Amending Regulations* 253
 - 7.3.2 *Amending Recommendations* 254
 - 7.3.3 *Reviewing a Programme of Activities* 255
 - 7.3.4 *Updating Regional Environmental Management Plans* 256
 - 7.3.5 *Some Suggestions for Changes to the Procedural Framework* 257
 - 7.4 *Ensuring Transparency and Participation* 260
 - 7.4.1 *Transparency* 260
 - 7.4.2 *Public Participation* 263
 - 7.4.3 *Some Suggestions for Ensuring Transparency and Public Participation* 266
 - 7.5 *The Burden of Proof* 269
 - 7.5.1 *The Status Quo in the ISA's Legal Framework* 270
 - 7.5.2 *The Reversal of the Burden of Proof in Specific Cases* 272
 - 7.6 *Monitoring of Environmental Effects* 272
 - 7.6.1 *Monitoring Programme for Contractors* 273

7.6.2	<i>Monitoring the Environmental Effects of Protective Measures</i>	276
7.6.3	<i>Monitoring Environmental Effects on a Regional Scale</i>	277
7.7	Conclusion	277
8	Implementing the Precautionary Principle: Institutional Aspects	281
8.1	Introduction	281
8.2	Institutional Mechanisms for Implementing Precaution	283
8.2.1	<i>Mechanisms for the Assessment of Environmental Risks and Protective Measures</i>	283
8.2.2	<i>Mechanisms for Ensuring Compliance</i>	286
8.3	Current Institutional Limitations	289
8.3.1	<i>Capacity and Limitations of the Legal and Technical Commission</i>	289
8.3.2	<i>Capacity and Limitations of the ISA Secretariat</i>	292
8.4	Options for Institutional Innovation for the ISA	294
8.4.1	<i>An Environmental Commission</i>	294
8.4.2	<i>A Mining Inspectorate</i>	297
8.5	Conclusion	300
9	Conclusion	303
9.1	The Complexities of Implementing the Precautionary Principle	303
9.2	The Strengths and Weaknesses of the ISA's Current Approach to Precaution	305
9.2.1	<i>Absence of a Conservation Objective</i>	305
9.2.2	<i>Lack of Obligation to Identify Uncertainties</i>	305
9.2.3	<i>Strength Derived from Affording Scientific Information a Central Role</i>	306
9.2.4	<i>Procedural Challenges Associated with Environmental Impact Assessments and Adaptive Management</i>	307
9.2.5	<i>Lack of Strategic Vision</i>	308
9.2.6	<i>Successes and Challenges with Respect to Timely Action</i>	308
9.2.7	<i>Successes and Challenges with Respect to the Role of the ISA in Marine Scientific Research</i>	309
9.2.8	Conclusion	309
9.3	Strengthening the Implementation of the Precautionary Principle by the ISA: Suggestions for a Way Forward	310
	Bibliography	315
	Index	348