

A PRACTITIONER'S  
GUIDE TO MARITIME  
BOUNDARY  
DELIMITATION

STEPHEN FIETTA AND ROBIN CLEVERLY

251

OXFORD  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP,  
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.  
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,  
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of  
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Stephen Fietta and Robin Cleverly 2016

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2016

Impression: 2

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in  
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the  
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted  
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics  
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the  
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the  
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence  
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI  
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2015960007

ISBN 978-0-19-965747-6

Printed and bound by  
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and  
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials  
contained in any third party website referenced in this work

## CONTENTS

|                                                                                                                                                                    |       |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------|
| <i>Table of Cases</i>                                                                                                                                              | xv    |
| <i>List of Figures</i>                                                                                                                                             | xix   |
| <i>Abbreviations</i>                                                                                                                                               | xxiii |
| A. COMMENTARY ON THE MODERN INTERNATIONAL<br>LAW OF MARITIME BOUNDARY DELIMITATION                                                                                 |       |
| 1. Context                                                                                                                                                         | 3     |
| I. What is the International Law of Maritime Boundary Delimitation?                                                                                                | 3     |
| II. The Early History of Maritime Claims and Maritime Boundary<br>Delimitation                                                                                     | 5     |
| III. The Relevant Zones of Maritime Sovereignty and Jurisdiction<br>under the Modern Law                                                                           | 16    |
| a. Territorial sea                                                                                                                                                 | 17    |
| b. Continental shelf                                                                                                                                               | 18    |
| c. Exclusive economic zone ('EEZ')                                                                                                                                 | 21    |
| d. The 'régime of islands' under Part VIII of UNCLOS                                                                                                               | 23    |
| IV. The Basis of the Modern Law of Delimitation: Articles 15, 74,<br>and 83 of UNCLOS                                                                              | 24    |
| V. 'The Land Dominates the Sea'                                                                                                                                    | 27    |
| 2. Methodology                                                                                                                                                     | 30    |
| I. Some Essential Preliminaries in the Delimitation Process                                                                                                        | 30    |
| a. Is there a delimitation agreement in force?                                                                                                                     | 30    |
| b. Coastlines as the foundation for maritime claims                                                                                                                | 32    |
| c. The 'baseline from which the breadth of the territorial sea is measured'                                                                                        | 33    |
| d. Low-tide elevations                                                                                                                                             | 43    |
| e. Identification of the 'relevant coasts' and the 'relevant area'                                                                                                 | 45    |
| II. The 'Standard' Methodology in Modern All-Purpose Maritime<br>Delimitations: The 'Three-Stage Approach'                                                         | 52    |
| a. Stage one: equidistance                                                                                                                                         | 55    |
| b. Stage two: adjustment of the provisional equidistance line as<br>required by 'special' or 'relevant' circumstances in order to<br>achieve an 'equitable result' | 65    |
| c. Stage three: the 'disproportionality check'                                                                                                                     | 93    |



|                                                                                                                                  |            |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| III. Situations Where the 'Standard' Methodology Might Be Inappropriate or Inapplicable                                          | 95         |
| a. The existence of a prior delimitation agreement                                                                               | 96         |
| b. Alternative delimitation methods absent a delimitation agreement                                                              | 97         |
| c. Bisectors: a true surrogate for equidistance                                                                                  | 99         |
| d. Perpendiculars: an approximate surrogate for equidistance                                                                     | 103        |
| e. Parallels, meridians, and azimuths                                                                                            | 104        |
| IV. Special Considerations in the Delimitation of Specific Maritime Zones                                                        | 106        |
| a. The territorial sea: UNCLOS Article 15; historic title; other special circumstances                                           | 106        |
| b. Single EEZ, fisheries zone, or continental shelf delimitations                                                                | 108        |
| c. The continental shelf beyond 200 nautical miles and the 'grey area'                                                           | 109        |
| <b>3. Practical Considerations</b>                                                                                               | <b>114</b> |
| I. Negotiation or Litigation?                                                                                                    | 114        |
| a. The pre-eminence of 'agreement' under Articles 15, 74, and 83 of UNCLOS                                                       | 114        |
| b. Novel negotiated outcomes at variance with standard delimitation methodologies                                                | 115        |
| c. 'Provisional arrangements of a practical nature'                                                                              | 116        |
| II. Third-Party Dispute Resolution                                                                                               | 122        |
| a. The duty to negotiate                                                                                                         | 122        |
| b. The duty to litigate/arbitrate                                                                                                | 123        |
| c. Non-appearance by a State party to the dispute                                                                                | 126        |
| III. Practical Considerations Surrounding the Choice of Forum: ICJ, ITLOS, or Arbitration?                                       | 127        |
| IV. The Life of a Typical Delimitation Case                                                                                      | 132        |
| a. Provisional measures                                                                                                          | 133        |
| b. Questions of jurisdiction, scope, and mandate                                                                                 | 136        |
| V. The Critical Role of Evidence in Modern Delimitation Disputes                                                                 | 141        |
| VI. Intervention by Third States and Role of Third-State Interests                                                               | 144        |
| VII. The Preparation of a Claim and the Importance of an Effective and Well-Managed Delimitation Team                            | 146        |
| a. The composition of the team                                                                                                   | 146        |
| b. The structure, management, and leadership of the team                                                                         | 147        |
| c. The role of the technical expert                                                                                              | 149        |
| VIII. The Judgment or Award and Its Implementation                                                                               | 152        |
| a. Different forms of judgment and award                                                                                         | 152        |
| b. Post-judgment or award considerations: revision, interpretation, and related procedures                                       | 153        |
| c. Implementation: challenges and pitfalls                                                                                       | 154        |
| d. The role of the technical expert in ensuring the smooth interpretation and implementation of a delimitation judgment or award | 156        |

Contents

B. COMMENTARY ON JUDGMENTS AND AWARDS IN  
MARITIME BOUNDARY DELIMITATION DISPUTES

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 1. <i>North Sea Continental Shelf</i> Cases (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 20 February 1969)                                                                                                                                              | 161 |
| 2. <i>Argentina v. Chile</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal, 18 February 1977)                                                                                                                                                                             | 177 |
| 3. <i>United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland v. French Republic</i> (Decision of the ad hoc 'Court of Arbitration', 30 June 1977)                                                                                                             | 186 |
| 4. <i>Dubai-Sharjah Border Arbitration</i> (Award of the ad hoc 'Court of Arbitration', 19 October 1981)                                                                                                                                                    | 210 |
| 5. <i>Tunisia v. Libya</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 24 February 1982)                                                                                                                                                               | 221 |
| 6. <i>Canada v. United States of America</i> (Judgment of the Chamber of the International Court of Justice, 12 October 1984)                                                                                                                               | 243 |
| 7. <i>Guinea v. Guinea-Bissau</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal, 14 February 1985)                                                                                                                                                                        | 264 |
| 8. <i>Libya v. Malta</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 3 June 1985)                                                                                                                                                                      | 282 |
| 9. <i>Guinea-Bissau v. Senegal</i> (Arbitral Award, 31 July 1989)                                                                                                                                                                                           | 297 |
| 10. <i>Canada v. France</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal, 10 June 1992)                                                                                                                                                                                  | 311 |
| 11. <i>Denmark v. Norway</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 14 June 1993)                                                                                                                                                                 | 329 |
| 12. <i>Eritrea v. Yemen</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal in the Second Stage of the Proceedings, Phase II: Maritime Delimitation, 17 December 1999)                                                                                                      | 343 |
| 13. <i>Qatar v. Bahrain</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice (Merits), 16 March 2001)                                                                                                                                                        | 364 |
| 14. <i>Newfoundland and Labrador v. Nova Scotia</i> (Awards of the Tribunal in the First and Second Phases of an Arbitration Concerning Portions of the Limits of the Parties' Respective Offshore Areas, Dated 17 May 2001 and 26 March 2002 Respectively) | 382 |
| 15. <i>Cameroon v. Nigeria: Equatorial Guinea Intervening</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 10 October 2002)                                                                                                                             | 400 |



*Contents*

---

|                                                                                                                                                             |         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 16. <i>Barbados v. Trinidad and Tobago</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal, 11 April 2006)                                                                  | 420     |
| 17. <i>Guyana v. Suriname</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal, 17 September 2007)                                                                           | 439     |
| 18. <i>Nicaragua v. Honduras</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 8 October 2007)                                                           | 453     |
| 19. <i>Romania v. Ukraine</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 3 February 2009)                                                             | 471     |
| 20. <i>Bangladesh v. Myanmar</i> (Judgment of the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea, 14 March 2012)                                             | 491     |
| 21. <i>Nicaragua v. Colombia</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 19 November 2012)                                                         | 509     |
| 22. <i>Peru v. Chile</i> (Judgment of the International Court of Justice, 27 January 2014)                                                                  | 533     |
| 23. <i>Bangladesh v. India</i> (Award of the Arbitral Tribunal, 7 July 2014)                                                                                | 549     |
| <br>C. FUTURE CHALLENGES<br><br>                                                                                                                            |         |
| 1. The Creeping Subjectivity of Base-Point Selection: A Lurch toward a 'Four-Stage Approach' (or a Return to Equitable Principles)?                         | 575     |
| 2. The Inconsistent Approach of Courts and Tribunals in the Adjustment of Provisional Equidistance Lines to Accommodate Geographical Relevant Circumstances | 584     |
| 3. Relevant Coasts, Relevant Areas, and Proportionality: Variances of Approach and a More Discrete Role for Proportionality in the Delimitation Process?    | 594     |
| 4. Delimitation of the Outer Continental Shelf: Questions of Delineation and Methodology                                                                    | 610     |
| <br>Annex I: Technical Glossary                                                                                                                             | <br>621 |
| Annex II: Treaty Instruments                                                                                                                                | 626     |
| Annex III: Sample Arbitration Agreements                                                                                                                    | 641     |
| <br><i>Index</i>                                                                                                                                            | <br>653 |