

scholarship in the fields
tive law. Although these
the 1946 confirm their
making of law at national,
law is now often affected
classical conflicts rules are
law under international
those involving state eco-
nomic international law,
rights and democratic
(international law) international
arrangements relating to
norms, are a focus of

disciplinary character, and
or comparative law or
problems are equally wel-
come in other languages.

Faculty of Law, University

University of Cambridge

Underwater Cultural Heritage and International Law

Sarah Dromgoole



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521842310

© Sarah Dromgoole 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

3rd printing 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Print on Demand, World Wide

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Dromgoole, Sarah.

Underwater cultural heritage and international law / Sarah Dromgoole.
pages cm.

ISBN 978-0-521-84231-0 (Hardback)

1. Underwater archaeology – Law and legislation. 2. Cultural property – Protection (International law) 3. Convention on the Protection of Underwater Cultural Heritage (2001) 4. Unesco. I. Title.

K3791.D76 2013

344'.09409162–dc23 2013003684

ISBN 978-0-521-84231-0 Hardback

Additional resources for this publication at www.cambridge.org/dromgoole

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page xv</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xviii</i>
<i>Table of cases</i>	<i>xx</i>
<i>Table of domestic legislation</i>	<i>xxiii</i>
<i>Table of treaties and other international instruments</i>	<i>xxv</i>
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	<i>xxx</i>
General introduction	1
1 A brief historical overview	2
1.1 Early developments	2
1.2 1985: A turning point	4
1.3 More recent developments	5
2 Relevant branches of law	8
2.1 Admiralty/private maritime law	8
2.2 The law of the sea	9
2.2.1 UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 1982	10
2.2.2 Maritime zones and related terminology	12
2.3 Cultural heritage law	16
3 A few observations on international law	17
3.1 Sovereignty and jurisdiction	18
3.2 Sources of international law	19
3.2.1 Treaties	19
3.2.2 Customary international law	22
3.2.3 The relationship between customary international law and treaties	23
4 UNESCO Convention on the Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage 2001	23
5 The approach and structure of this book	26

1	The evolution of international law on underwater cultural heritage	28
1	Introduction	28
2	Initiatives preceding the UNESCO Convention 2001	29
2.1	UN Convention on the Law of the Sea 1982 (LOSC)	29
2.1.1	Article 149	30
2.1.2	Article 303	32
2.1.3	An 'incomplete' regime	35
2.2	Developments within the Council of Europe	36
2.2.1	The Roper Report and Recommendation 848 (1978)	37
2.2.2	Draft European Convention 1985	40
2.2.3	Valletta Convention 1992	44
3	The UNESCO initiative	48
3.1	Background and process	49
3.1.1	Groundwork by the International Law Association	49
3.1.2	The UNESCO process	52
3.1.3	Development and status of the Annex	57
3.2	The UNESCO Convention 2001: overview	59
4	Concluding remarks	63
2	Defining underwater cultural heritage	65
1	Introduction	65
2	The approach of early domestic legislation	67
3	The approach of international initiatives preceding the UNESCO Convention 2001	71
3.1	The Law of the Sea Convention 1982	71
3.2	The Council of Europe initiatives	77
3.2.1	Recommendation 848 (1978)	77
3.2.2	Draft European Convention 1985	80
3.2.3	Valletta Convention 1992	83
4	The approach of the UNESCO Convention 2001	86
4.1	Definitional criteria	87
4.2	Selection criteria	90
4.2.1	The temporal criterion	90
4.2.2	The character criterion	91
5	Concluding remarks	94

3	Ownership and other interests in underwater cultural heritage	96
1	Introduction	96
2	Ownership	97
2.1	Acquisition of ownership rights	98
2.2	Establishment of ownership rights	102
2.3	Abandonment of ownership rights	106
2.4	The circumscription or expropriation of ownership rights by heritage legislation	111
3	Treatment of ownership rights by international law	113
3.1	Ownership and the Law of the Sea Convention 1982	114
3.2	Ownership and the UNESCO Convention 2001	115
3.2.1	Background	115
3.2.2	Approach of the UNESCO Convention and its implications	117
4	Other interests recognised by international law	119
4.1	Interests recognised by the Law of the Sea Convention 1982	119
4.1.1	Interests of mankind	119
4.1.2	Preferential rights of states (or countries) of origin	122
4.2	Interests recognised by the UNESCO Convention 2001	125
4.2.1	Interests of humanity	126
4.2.2	Interests of states with a verifiable link	127
4.2.3	Preferential rights of states of cultural, historical or archaeological origin	132
5	Concluding remarks	133
4	Sunken warships and other state vessels and aircraft	134
1	Introduction	134
2	Sunken state craft: general international law and state practice	136
2.1	Sunken state craft and the principle of sovereign immunity	136
2.2	State practice in respect of sunken state craft	139
2.3	Treatment of sunken state craft by the US federal admiralty courts	146
2.3.1	<i>The Juno and La Galga (Sea Hunt)</i> (2000)	147
2.3.2	<i>The Mercedes</i> (2011)	149

2.4	Assessment of position under customary international law	152
3	Sunken state craft and the UNESCO Convention 2001	154
3.1	Background	154
3.2	The Convention's regime for sunken state craft	155
3.2.1	Specific regime for each maritime zone	156
3.2.2	Preservation of existing international law	159
3.3	Potential for resolving concerns	160
4	Concluding remarks	165
5	Application of salvage law and the law of finds	167
1	Introduction	167
2	Introduction to salvage law and the law of finds	168
2.1	Basic principles of the law of salvage	168
2.2	Basic principles of the law of finds	171
2.3	International regulation of salvage law	172
3	Application of the law of salvage and the law of finds to underwater cultural heritage	173
3.1	Approach of the Law of the Sea Convention 1982	176
3.2	Approach of the Salvage Convention 1989	177
3.3	Domestic law approaches	179
3.4	US federal admiralty law	184
3.4.1	Early treasure salvage cases	185
3.4.2	Introduction of the Abandoned Shipwreck Act	187
3.4.3	Modification of US federal salvage law to accommodate archaeological value	189
3.4.4	Relationship between US federal law and the Salvage Convention 1989	194
3.4.5	A void to be filled	197
4	Treatment of the laws of salvage and finds by the UNESCO Convention 2001	200
4.1	Background	200
4.2	Approach of the UNESCO Convention and its implications	202
4.3	Relationship between the UNESCO Convention and the Salvage Convention 1989	204
4.4	Response of the international maritime community	206
5	Concluding remarks	208

6	Commercial exploitation of underwater cultural heritage	210
1	Introduction	210
2	Commercial exploitation: some models	212
2.1	Commercial exploitation <i>excluding</i> sale of artefacts	213
2.2	Commercial exploitation <i>including</i> sale of artefacts	213
2.2.1	ProSEA model	214
2.2.2	'Partnering agreements'	216
3	Commercial exploitation: the debate	218
3.1	The case against commercial exploitation	219
3.2	The case in favour of commercial exploitation	220
3.3	Room for compromise?	221
3.4	Government participation in commercial exploitation	224
4	Commercial exploitation and the UNESCO Convention 2001	226
4.1	Background	226
4.2	The Convention's approach to commercial exploitation	230
4.2.1	Basic principle: UCH shall not be commercially exploited	231
4.2.2	Proviso (a): provision of professional archaeological services	233
4.2.3	Proviso (b): deposition of UCH	234
4.3	Implications of the Convention's regime	236
5	Concluding remarks	239
7	Rights, jurisdiction and duties under general international law	241
1	Introduction	241
2	Use of general principles of international jurisdiction in the context of underwater cultural heritage	242
2.1	Territorial principle	242
2.2	Nationality principle	244
3	Rights, jurisdiction and duties under the Law of the Sea Convention	245
3.1	Duties under Article 303(1)	246
3.2	Maritime spaces subject to coastal state sovereignty	248
3.3	The contiguous zone	249
3.4	The continental shelf and the exclusive economic zone	256
3.5	Beyond the limits of national jurisdiction	260

xii CONTENTS

4	Plugging the gap(s)	263
4.1	Unilateral extensions	264
4.2	Making full use of the Law of the Sea Convention provisions	267
4.2.1	Protection of sovereign rights	267
4.2.2	Utilisation of jurisdictional rights	269
4.3	Making full use of the territorial and nationality principles of international jurisdiction	273
5	Concluding remarks	275
8	UNESCO Convention 2001: jurisdictional mechanisms	276
1	Introduction	276
2	Relationship with the Law of the Sea Convention	277
3	Control mechanisms	281
3.1	General mechanisms	283
3.2	Maritime spaces subject to coastal state sovereignty	285
3.3	The contiguous zone	287
3.4	The continental shelf and the exclusive economic zone	288
3.5	The Area	294
3.6	Compliance with the Law of the Sea Convention: a matter of interpretation	298
4	Potential effectiveness of the regime	303
5	Concluding remarks	305
9	UNESCO Convention 2001: implementation issues	307
1	Introduction	307
2	The role of competent national authorities	308
3	Authorisation of activities directed at underwater cultural heritage	312
3.1	Authorisation scheme	313
3.2	Preservation <i>in situ</i>	314
3.3	Treatment of recovered artefacts	319
4	Access	320
4.1	Impact on recreational divers	321
4.2	Impact on avocational archaeologists	323
4.3	Impact on the general public	325
4.4	Maritime memorials	326

CONTENTS xiii

5	Sanctions and deterrents	329
5.1	Seizure	330
5.2	Related deterrents	334
6	Concluding remarks	337
10	UNESCO Convention 2001: further matters	338
1	Introduction	338
2	Inter-state agreements furthering the Convention's objectives	338
3	Impact of the Convention on activities 'incidentally affecting' underwater cultural heritage	344
3.1	The continental shelf and the exclusive economic zone	348
3.2	The Area	350
4	Dispute settlement	354
5	Technical implementation	358
5.1	Meeting of States Parties	359
5.2	Scientific and Technical Advisory Body	361
5.3	UNESCO Secretariat	362
6	Amendment	363
7	Reservations	364
	 Final reflections	 366
	 Bibliography	 375
	Index	388