

DUGARD'S INTERNATIONAL LAW

A South African Perspective

Fifth edition

By

John Dugard SC

Max du Plessis SC

Tiyanjana Maluwa

Dire Tladi

With contributions by

Anton Katz SC

Arnold Pronto

Andreas Coutsoudis

Eshed Cohen

Jackie Dugard

Rosalind Elphick

Kholofelo Kugler



JUTA

First published 1994
Second Edition 2000
Third Edition 2005
Fourth Edition 2011
Fifth Edition 2018

Juta and Company Ltd, First floor, Sunclare Building,
21 Dreyer Street, Claremont, 7708
© 2018 Juta & Company (Pty) Ltd

This book is copyright under the Berne Convention. In terms of the copyright Act 98 of 1978, no part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission from the publisher.

The authors and the publisher believe on the strength of due diligence exercised that this work does not contain any material that is the subject of copyright held by another person. In the alternative, they believe that any protected pre-existing material that may be comprised in it has been used with the appropriate authority or has been used in circumstances that may make such use permissible by law.

Although every care is taken to ensure the accuracy of this publication, supplements, updates and replacement material, the authors, editors, publishers and printers do not accept responsibility for any act, omission, loss, damage or the consequences thereof occasioned by a reliance by any person upon the contents hereof.

ISBN: 9781485128281

Typesetter: Brian Hopking
Cover designer: Matthew Bubeare-Craemer
Printed in South Africa by DJE Flexible Print Solutions

Contents

Preface to the Fifth Edition	vii
Notes on Authors	ix
Abbreviations.....	xxiii
Table of Cases.....	xxix
Table of Statutes.....	lvii
Chapter 1: The Nature and History of International Law — John Dugard	1
DIFFERENCES BETWEEN INTERNATIONAL LAW AND MUNICIPAL LAW	3
1 Legislature	3
2 Executive authority.....	4
3 International courts.....	5
THE PROBLEM OF SANCTIONS	6
IS INTERNATIONAL LAW REALLY LAW?.....	9
THE HISTORY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW (INCLUDING THEORIES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW).....	11
THE FRAGMENTATION OF INTERNATIONAL LAW.....	17
Chapter 2: South Africa and International Law: A Historical Introduction — John Dugard	18
Chapter 3: Sources of International Law — John Dugard and Dire Tladi	28
INTRODUCTION.....	28
TREATIES OR CONVENTIONS.....	29
1 Contractual.....	29
2 Legislative	30
3 Constitutional	30
CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW.....	30
1 Elements of customary international law	31
(a) Settled practice (usus).....	31
(b) <i>Opinio juris</i>	36
2 Resolutions of international organisations	37
3 Soft law	41
THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN CUSTOMARY INTERNATIONAL LAW AND TREATY LAW	42
GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LAW RECOGNISED BY CIVILISED NATIONS.....	43
JUDICIAL PRECEDENT	45
TEXT WRITINGS	46
UNILATERAL ACTS OF STATES.....	46
CODIFICATION	47
<i>JUS COGENS</i>, OBLIGATIONS <i>ERGA OMNES</i> AND A SYSTEM OF HIGHER NORMS.....	49

Chapter 4: The Place of International Law in South African Municipal Law — John Dugard and Andreas Coutsoudis	57
ROMAN-DUTCH LAW	58
ANGLO-AMERICAN LAW	60
SOUTH AFRICAN LAW BEFORE 1994	61
1 Customary international law	62
2 Treaties and municipal courts	64
THE NEW CONSTITUTIONAL ORDER	65
1 The 1993 and 1996 Constitutions	65
2 Customary international law	67
3 Proof of customary international law	67
4 Treaties	72
5 Self-executing treaties	81
6 The national executive and the making of treaties	86
7 International agreements or treaties	87
8 Resolutions of international organisations	88
9 Statutory (including constitutional) interpretation with special reference to human rights	89
10 Hierarchy of treaties in municipal law	99
11 The executive certificate	100
12 The justiciability of acts of state	104
(a) The justiciability of acts of the South African government in foreign relations	105
(b) The justiciability of acts of foreign governments	116
13 The extraterritorial application of the Constitution	123
Chapter 5: States (Including Recognition and Non-recognition) — John Dugard	126
THE CRITERIA FOR STATEHOOD	128
1 Permanent population	128
2 Defined territory	129
3 Government	129
4 Capacity to enter into relations with other states	130
5 Respect for human rights and self-determination	134
RECOGNITION	136
UNILATERAL RECOGNITION	137
THE METHOD OF RECOGNITION	140
COLLECTIVE RECOGNITION BY THE UNITED NATIONS AND DECOLONISATION	140
COLLECTIVE NON-RECOGNITION	145
SELF-DETERMINATION, TERRITORIAL INTEGRITY AND SECESSION	149
1 Self-determination	149
(a) Self-determination as the right of colonial peoples only	150
(b) External or internal self-determination	151
(c) The 'self' in self-determination	152
2 Territorial integrity	153

3	State practice and judicial decisions on secession.	154
	(a) Kosovo opinion	158
	(b) Post-Kosovo developments	160
4	Conclusion	162
5	A South African postscript	163
	FAILED STATES.	163
	Chapter 6: Recognition of Governments — John Dugard	165
	<i>DE FACTO</i> AND <i>DE JURE</i> RECOGNITION.	169
	Chapter 7: Recognition in Municipal Law — John Dugard	171
	PROOF OF RECOGNITION	171
	LEGAL EFFECT OF ACTS OF UNRECOGNISED STATES AND GOVERNMENTS	174
	Chapter 8: Territory — John Dugard and Rosalind Elphick	180
	BACKGROUND CONCEPTS	182
1	Intertemporal law	182
2	<i>Utī possidetis</i>	186
3	Original versus derivative title	188
	THE MODES OF ACQUISITION OF TERRITORY	188
1	Discovery	188
2	Occupation	188
3	Accretion.	193
4	Cession	194
5	Conquest	196
6	Prescription.	199
7	Estoppel	201
8	Territorial claims based on the right of self-determination	202
	(a) Legal ties of a historical nature	202
	(b) Colonial enclaves.	203
9	Concluding comments	204
	TERRITORIAL DISPUTES IN AFRICA	205
	ANTARCTICA.	208
	Chapter 9: Jurisdiction and International Crimes — John Dugard, Max du Plessis and Eshed Cohen	210
	JURISDICTION	210
1	Territoriality	214
2	Subjective and objective territoriality.	216
3	Protection of the state	218
4	Nationality	219
5	Passive personality	221
6	Universal jurisdiction and international crimes	222
	INTERNATIONAL CRIMES	227
1	Customary international law crimes	227
2	International treaty crimes	228
	(a) Genocide	228
	(b) Apartheid	228

	(c) Torture	230
	(d) Hijacking	231
	(e) Offences against the safety of maritime navigation	233
	(f) Drug-trafficking	234
	(g) International terrorism	234
3	The Protection of Constitutional Democracy against Terrorist and Related Activities Act 33 of 2004	238
Chapter 10: International Criminal Courts, the International Criminal Court, and South Africa's Implementation of the Rome Statute — Max du Plessis and Eshed Cohen		
	INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURTS	245
	THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT	249
	ICC CRIMES	250
1	Genocide	251
2	Crimes against humanity	254
3	War crimes	258
	(a) War crimes in times of international armed conflict	260
	(b) War crimes in times of non-international armed conflict	262
4	Aggression	265
	(a) The definition of the crime	266
	(b) Jurisdiction for the crime of aggression	268
	JURISDICTION	270
	ADMISSIBILITY	272
	SITUATIONS BEFORE THE ICC	276
1	An international criminal court for the 'usual suspects'	227
	SOUTH AFRICA'S IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ROME STATUTE	280
1	Incorporation of ICC crimes	281
2	Grounds of jurisdiction	282
3	Complementarity	284
4	Co-operation with the International Criminal Court	285
	(a) Arrest and surrender	285
	(b) Forms of assistance offered to the Court in fulfilment of article 93 of the Rome Statute	287
	(c) Specialised units	288
	(d) Discretionary measures of assistance	289
	(e) Enforcement of sentences	290
	IMMUNITIES	292
1	Immunity from arrest and surrender to the ICC	293
2	Immunity from domestic prosecution	295
3	Immunity from international prosecution before the ICC	297
4	South Africa's obligations regarding senior officials	298
	SOUTH AFRICA AND THE ICC	299
Chapter 11: Extradition — Anton Katz, Max du Plessis, Eshed Cohen and John Dugard		
	THE IMPACT OF THE CONSTITUTION	307
1	Human rights	307

2	The relationship between international and municipal law . . .	313
3	The rule of law	315
EXTRADITION DISTINGUISHED FROM OTHER FORMS OF		
	REMOVAL	316
1	Deportation (disguised extradition) from and to South Africa .	316
2	Abduction	318
3	Surrender to international criminal tribunals	323
EXTRADITION FROM SOUTH AFRICA TO FOREIGN STATES		
1	The administrative phase	324
2	The judicial phase	326
	(a) Extraditable offences and double criminality	329
	(b) Within the jurisdiction of the foreign state	331
3	The executive phase	333
	(a) Offences of a political character	336
EXTRADITION FROM SOUTH AFRICA TO ASSOCIATED STATES		
INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION IN THE SUPPRESSION OF		
	CRIME BY MEANS OTHER THAN EXTRADITION	342
Chapter 12: Immunity from Jurisdiction — John Dugard		
SOVEREIGN OR STATE IMMUNITY		
1	Foreign States Immunities Act 87 of 1981	350
	(a) Waiver	351
	(b) Commercial transactions	351
	(c) Contracts of employment	353
	(d) Personal injury and damage to property	354
	(e) Miscellaneous	355
2	Enforcement	356
3	The state, the government and separate entities	357
4	Indirect impleading and state immunity	359
IMMUNITY, HUMAN RIGHTS AND INTERNATIONAL CRIMES		
1	Criminal proceedings	361
2	Civil proceedings	370
DIPLOMATIC AND CONSULAR IMMUNITY		
1	The Diplomatic Immunities and Privileges Act (excluding the Conventions in the schedules)	376
2	The Vienna Convention on Diplomatic Relations 1961 (Schedule 1)	379
	(a) Inviolability	380
	(b) Extraterritoriality of missions	381
	(c) Diplomatic immunities	382
3	The Vienna Convention on Consular Relations 1963 (Schedule 2)	384
ASYLUM IN DIPLOMATIC AND CONSULAR PREMISES		
Chapter 13: State Responsibility, Diplomatic Protection and the		
Treatment of Aliens — John Dugard		
THE DRAFT ARTICLES ON STATE RESPONSIBILITY		
1	Attribution of conduct to a state	393

2	Circumstances precluding wrongfulness.	398
3	Legal consequences of internationally wrongful acts	400
4	Serious breaches of peremptory norms	402
5	Invocation of the responsibility of a state	402
6	Countermeasures.	403
	DIPLOMATIC PROTECTION	405
	NATIONALITY	407
1	Nationality of natural persons.	408
2	Nationality of corporations and shareholders.	412
3	Continuous nationality.	417
4	Is there a right to diplomatic protection?	417
	EXHAUSTION OF LOCAL REMEDIES.	422
1	Calvo Clause.	426
	THE IMPLEMENTATION OF DIPLOMATIC PROTECTION	426
	THE TREATMENT OF ALIENS	427
1	The personal rights of aliens	430
2	Diplomatic protection and human rights.	432
3	The property rights of aliens—with special reference to expropriation of property.	432
4	State contracts	436
5	Unlawful nationalisations before foreign municipal courts	438
6	Alternative procedures for the protection of investment and the settlement of investment disputes	439
	Chapter 14: Responsibility of International Organisations — Arnold Pronto	442
	INTERNATIONAL LEGAL PERSONALITY.	443
	DEFINITION OF AN INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION.	444
1	By analysing their composition.	444
2	By reference to the method of establishment.	445
3	By implication from the existence of separate legal personality	445
	APPLICABLE LAW AND CONCEPT OF THE 'RULES OF THE ORGANISATION'.	446
	CIRCUMSTANCES UNDER WHICH RESPONSIBILITY MAY ARISE FOR AN INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION.	447
1	Attribution of conduct to the international organisation	447
2	Responsibility in connection with an act of a state or other international organisation	451
	THE RESPONSIBILITY OF STATES MEMBERS OF AN INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATION FOR THE ACTS OF AN ORGANISATION	451
	THE FUTURE OF THE DRAFT ARTICLES ON RESPONSIBILITY OF INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS.	453
	Chapter 15: Human Rights — John Dugard and Jackie Dugard	454
	THE NUREMBERG TRIAL	455
	THE CHARTER OF THE UNITED NATIONS	456

1	South Africa's racial policies and the human rights clauses of the UN Charter 1949–1994	457
	UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	460
	THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANTS AND CONVENTIONS.	462
	THE TWO CORNERSTONE INTERNATIONAL COVENANTS	465
1	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)	465
	(a) State reports	467
	(b) General comments	467
	(c) Individual complaints	468
2	The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)	469
	(a) State reports	472
	(b) General comments	473
	(c) Individual complaints	473
	THE OTHER SEVEN INTERNATIONAL CONVENTIONS	474
1	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD)	474
2	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)	476
3	Torture (CAT)	478
4	Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)	480
5	Migrant workers (CMW)	481
6	Enforced disappearance (CED)	481
7	Disabled people (CRPD)	482
	EMERGING RIGHTS	482
1	Business and human rights	483
2	UN human rights bodies	484
	(a) Human Rights Council	484
	(b) The Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights	487
	CONVENTIONS, DECLARATIONS, AND STANDARDS.	488
1	ILO standards	489
2	Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners	489
	REGIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS CONVENTIONS	489
1	The European Convention on Human Rights	490
2	The Inter-American system	493
3	The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	495
	INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS AND SOUTH AFRICAN LAW	495
	Chapter 16: Refugees and Stateless Persons — Anton Katz and Tyanjana Maluwa	502
	INTRODUCTION	502
	REFUGEES	502
1	The genesis of international refugee law	505
2	The definition of a refugee	507
	(a) Well-founded fear of persecution	509

(b) Political opinion	511
(c) Membership of a particular social group	513
(d) The expanded refugee definition in the 1969 OAU Convention	515
(e) 'Bootstrap' refugees or refugees sur place	516
SOUTH AFRICAN PROCEDURE BEFORE THE REFUGEES ACT	517
THE REFUGEES ACT	519
1 <i>Non-refoulement</i> and access to South African territory	520
2 Procedure for application for refugee status	522
3 Asylum-seekers	523
(a) Decisions on asylum applications	523
(b) Detention of failed asylum-seekers	525
(c) Exclusion from refugee status	526
(d) Cessation of refugee status	526
4 Amendments to the Refugees Act: New procedures	527
5 Refugee law and immigration law	531
6 Application for residence or immigration status	531
7 Failed asylum-seekers and their eligibility for deportation under immigration law	532
INEFFECTIVE PROTECTION IN SOUTH AFRICA	533
STATELESSNESS (Rosalind Elphick)	535
Chapter 17: Law of the Sea — John Dugard and Dire Tladi	539
INTRODUCTION	539
MARITIME ZONES	542
1 Internal waters	542
2 Territorial sea	546
3 Straits	551
4 Contiguous zone	551
5 Exclusive economic zone	551
6 The high seas	554
(a) Jurisdiction over ships on the high seas	556
(b) Piracy	559
(c) Hot pursuit	560
(d) Rescue powers of South African ships	561
7 Continental shelf	561
8 The deep seabed	569
THE MARINE ENVIRONMENT	573
1 General	573
2 Pollution	574
3 Conservation and sustainable use of marine biodiversity in areas beyond national jurisdiction	575
SETTLEMENT OF DISPUTES	576
Chapter 18: Air and Space Law — John Dugard and Rosalind Elphick	578
AIR LAW	578
1 Distress	581

2	Aerial intrusion	582
3	Drones	583
4	Air defence identification zones	583
	OUTER SPACE	584
	Chapter 19: International Environmental Law — John Dugard and Dire Tladi	586
	INTRODUCTION	586
	STATE RESPONSIBILITY AND THE ENVIRONMENT	588
	LIABILITY FOR ACTS NOT PROHIBITED BY INTERNATIONAL LAW	591
	PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION	592
1	Sustainable development	593
2	Notification	595
3	Environmental impact assessment	596
4	Precautionary principle	597
5	'Polluter pays' principle	597
	TRADE AND THE ENVIRONMENT	598
	ENVIRONMENTAL TREATIES	600
1	Flora, fauna and biological diversity	600
2	Conservation of marine living resources	602
3	Ozone depletion, global warming and climate change	603
4	Nuclear activities	605
5	Hazardous waste	606
6	International watercourses	607
	Chapter 20: Treaties — John Dugard	608
	INTRODUCTION	608
	SOUTH AFRICA'S TREATY-MAKING CAPACITY	610
	THE MAKING OF TREATIES	610
	RESERVATIONS	612
	INVALIDITY OF TREATIES	618
	TERMINATION OF TREATIES	619
	INTERPRETATION OF TREATIES	622
	SUCCESSION TO TREATIES	625
	Chapter 21: International Economic Relations — Max du Plessis and Kholofelo Kugler	632
	INTRODUCTION	632
	THE SOURCES OF SOUTH AFRICA'S INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC LAW COMMITMENTS AND THE KEY OBLIGATIONS	635
1	International financial agreements	636
2	International trade agreements	638
3	International investment agreements	641
4	Conclusion on sources and key principles	644
	THE SIGNIFICANCE OF SOUTH AFRICA'S INTERNATIONAL OBLIGATIONS IN SOUTH AFRICAN MUNICIPAL LAW	645

THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION AND THE FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL TRADE . . .	648
1 Overview	648
2 The object, structure and operation of the World Trade Organization.	649
3 Dispute settlement.	650
4 The fundamental principles of international trade.	651
5 The operation of the dispute settlement system and South Africa's participation in World Trade Organization's disputes.	652
6 Anti-dumping legislation and investigations under the World Trade Organization Anti-Dumping Agreement	654
GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL INVESTMENT LAW	656
1 Overview	656
2 South Africa's international investment regime	658
3 The Protection of Investment Act	662
Chapter 22: International Adjudication — John Dugard and Rosalind Elphick	665
INTRODUCTION	665
A BRIEF HISTORY OF INTERNATIONAL ADJUDICATION	666
THE INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE	669
CONTENTIOUS PROCEEDINGS	671
1 Jurisdiction	672
(a) Cases which parties refer to the Court (special agreement)	673
(b) Cases provided for in treaties or conventions in force (compromissory clause)	674
(c) Matters specially provided for in UN Charter	675
(d) Optional clause	675
(e) Third parties.	681
2 Admissibility	682
3 Proceedings	684
4 Non-appearance.	685
5 Judgment and its enforcement.	686
6 The limits of international adjudication.	689
ADVISORY OPINIONS	691
THE PERMANENT COURT OF ARBITRATION (Jennifer Nettleton-Brom).	696
Chapter 23: The United Nations and the Maintenance of International Peace and Security — John Dugard and Tiyanjana Maluwa	701
INTRODUCTION	701
GENERAL ASSEMBLY	702
SECURITY COUNCIL	708
1 Chapter VI	710
2 Chapter VII.	712

(a) Provisional measures	715
(b) Non-forcible measures	715
(c) Forcible measures	718
(d) Legislation	720
3 Article 24	721
4 Review of Security Council action	722
PEACEKEEPING FORCES	723
SECRETARY-GENERAL	727
REGIONAL ARRANGEMENTS	727
Chapter 24: The Use of Force by States — Dire Tladi and John Dugard	730
INTRODUCTION	730
THE PROHIBITION ON THE USE OF FORCE	731
1 The forms of force prohibited	732
(a) Economic force	733
(b) Indirect force	734
CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH FORCE IS PERMITTED WITHOUT THE AUTHORISATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS	736
1 Self-defence	736
(a) General	736
(b) Anticipatory self-defence and pre-emptive action	739
(c) Self-defence and accumulation of events	742
(d) Collective self-defence	743
2 Hot pursuit	745
3 Defence of nationals	745
4 Humanitarian intervention	747
5 The invasion of Iraq in 2003	751
6 Intervention in civil strife and civil wars	753
(a) Intervention where the rebels are not externally assisted	753
(b) Intervention where the rebels are externally assisted	754
7 Wars of national liberation	757
8 Self-defence against non-state actors: the case of terrorism	759
Chapter 25: Humanitarian Law — John Dugard	765
INTRODUCTION	765
THE SOURCES AND SCOPE OF HUMANITARIAN LAW	765
1 Law of The Hague	766
2 The prohibition of weapons that cause unnecessary suffering	767
3 Law of Geneva	772
4 Principles of humanitarian law	773
(a) Combatants and prisoners of war	773
(b) Occupation and protection of civilians	775
(c) Distinction and proportionality	777
(d) International and non-international armed conflicts	778
(e) Human rights and international humanitarian law	782
(f) Enforcement of international humanitarian law	782

HUMANITARIAN LAW AND SOUTH AFRICAN MUNICIPAL LAW.	784
1 The Anglo-Boer War	784
2 The status of humanitarian treaties	785
3 Mercenaries (Shannon Bosch)	786
4 The treatment of members of national liberation movements ..	790
5 The Truth and Reconciliation Commission Report and international humanitarian law	792
Chapter 26: The African Union — Max du Plessis and Tiyanjana Maluwa	794
INTRODUCTION	794
THE ORGANIZATION OF AFRICAN UNITY	794
FROM THE OAU TO THE AFRICAN UNION	798
1 The objectives, principles and organs of the AU	800
2 The New Partnership for Africa's Development and the African Peer Review Mechanism	806
THE AFRICAN UNION AND PEACE AND SECURITY IN AFRICA ..	809
(a) The African Mission in Burundi (AMIB)	812
(b) Peace Operation in Burundi (ONUB)	813
(c) The African Mission in Sudan (AMIS)	814
(d) The African Mission in Somalia (AMISOM)	815
THE AFRICAN UNION AND HUMAN RIGHTS	816
1 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	818
2 African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights	822
3 African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights	826
4 Tension between African states, the UN Security Council and the International Criminal Court	833
THE QUEST FOR A PERMANENT SEAT FOR AFRICA ON THE UN SECURITY COUNCIL	836
INDEX	839