

# Legal Studies on Access and Benefit-sharing

*Series Editors*

Elisa Morgera  
Elsa Tsioumani

VOLUME 6

The titles published in this series are listed at [brill.com/labs](http://brill.com/labs)

# Incorporating Indigenous Rights in the International Regime on Biodiversity Protection

*Access, Benefit-sharing and Conservation  
in Indigenous Lands*

By

Federica Cittadino



BRILL  
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

WAL RIAHD IHCRAS

Cover illustration: Chiara Cittadino. *Armonia*. January 2019.

The Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available online at <http://catalog.loc.gov>  
LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2019907405>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: [brill.com/brill-typeface](http://brill.com/brill-typeface).

ISSN 2213-493X

ISBN 978-90-04-36419-6 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-36440-0 (e-book)

Copyright 2019 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi, Brill Sense, Hotei Publishing, mentis Verlag, Verlag Ferdinand Schöningh and Wilhelm Fink Verlag.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Printed by Printforce, the Netherlands

# Contents

Acknowledgments IX

List of Abbreviations X

Table of Treaties XIV

Table of Cases XVI

## Introduction 1

1 Aim of the Book 1

2 Defining the Scope of the Book: Who Are Indigenous Peoples? 7

3 Outline of the Book 12

## 1 Indigenous Rights and the Protection of Biodiversity: State of the Art 15

1 The Human Rights Approach to Environmental Protection: the Case of Indigenous Peoples 16

1.1 *The Global Mechanisms of Human Rights Protection* 16

1.1.1 The Human Rights Committee 16

1.1.2 The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) 21

1.1.3 The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 23

1.1.4 The ILO Monitoring System 26

1.2 *The Regional Mechanisms of Human Rights Protection* 31

1.2.1 The Inter-American System 31

1.2.2 The African Human Rights Mechanisms 38

1.2.3 The European Court of Human Rights 43

1.2.4 Asia and Oceania: National Cases and Contamination 47

1.3 *Main Common Trends and Differences* 49

1.4 *An Assessment of the Traditional Approach* 52

2 Indigenous Rights in the CBD: State of the Art and Underlying Problems 54

2.1 *The CBD: Objectives, Structure, and Functioning* 55

2.2 *The CBD and Indigenous Peoples* 58

3 Indigenous Rights in the CBD: beyond the Human Rights Approach to Environmental Protection 65

- 2 **Incorporating Indigenous Rights into the CBD: an Interpretative Approach** 67
  - 1 The Rights of Indigenous Peoples 68
    - 1.1 *The Right to Land* 72
    - 1.2 *The Right to Natural Resources* 93
    - 1.3 *Cultural Rights* 97
    - 1.4 *Participatory Rights* 102
    - 1.5 *The Right to Autonomy* 120
    - 1.6 *The Right to Self-Determination* 125
    - 1.7 *Some Considerations on the Corpus of Indigenous Rights* 139
  - 2 The Legal Status of Indigenous Peoples' Rights 141
    - 2.1 *Treaty Rights* 141
    - 2.2 *Customary Law: Human Rights Law and the UN Declaration* 144
  - 3 Self-Determination as a General Principle of International Law 155
  - 4 Incorporating Indigenous Rights into the CBD through Systemic Interpretation and the Principle of Self-Determination 162
- 3 **Access and Benefit-Sharing and Indigenous Peoples: Applying the Interpretative Approach** 174
  - 1 ABS and Indigenous Rights: Interpretative Problems and Harmonisation 174
  - 2 The Incorporation of Indigenous Rights into the International Regime on ABS 180
    - 2.1 *Access to Traditional Knowledge* 180
      - 2.1.1 The Link between Article 8(j) CBD and ABS 189
      - 2.1.2 Consent, Approval and Involvement 192
      - 2.1.3 The Notion of Traditional Knowledge Associated with Genetic Resources 200
      - 2.1.4 The Definition of Utilisation of Traditional Knowledge 204
    - 2.2 *Access to Genetic Resources Owned by Indigenous Peoples* 207
    - 2.3 *Benefit-Sharing* 217
      - 2.3.1 Multilateral Benefit-Sharing: a Comparison with ITPGRFA 232
    - 2.4 *Tools for Reconciliation and Main Limitations* 240
      - 2.4.1 Tools for Reconciliation 241
      - 2.4.2 Gaps and Limitations 256
  - 3 Unveiling the Relevance of Indigenous Rights and the Principle of Self-Determination: Applying the Interpretative Approach 260

<b>4</b>	<b>Conservation, Protected Areas and Indigenous Peoples: Applying the Interpretative Approach</b>	<b>264</b>
1	Conservation and Indigenous Rights: Interpretative Problems and Harmonisation	264
2	The Incorporation of Indigenous Rights into International Conservation Regimes	274
2.1	<i>Developments in the CBD: Indigenous Participatory Rights</i>	283
2.1.1	Participatory Rights and Ecosystem Approach	284
2.1.2	Participatory Rights and Protected Areas	286
2.1.3	Participatory Rights and ICCAs	296
2.2	<i>Developments in the WHC: Indigenous Participatory Rights</i>	299
2.2.1	Participatory Rights and the Creation and Management of World Heritage Sites	304
2.2.2	Participatory Rights and Mining in World Heritage Sites	314
2.3	<i>Common Elements: Tools for Reconciliation and Limitations</i>	318
3	Unveiling the Relevance of Indigenous Rights and the Principle of Self-Determination: Applying the Interpretative Approach	325
	<b>Conclusion: Avenues for Harmonisation with Indigenous Rights: the CBD and Beyond</b>	<b>335</b>
1	A Reasoned Summary: the Role of Self-Determination in Fostering Harmonisation	335
2	Against All Odds: Where the CBD Regime Is More Protective than Human Rights Law	341
3	The CBD Regime and Contamination with Indigenous Rights	343
4	The Global Relevance of Indigenous Rights and Future Avenues for Research	346
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>349</b>
	<b>Index</b>	<b>377</b>