

Statehood under Water

*Challenges of Sea-Level Rise to the
Continuity of Pacific Island States*

By

Alejandra Torres Camprubí

217



BRILL
NIJHOFF

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Torres Camprubí, Alejandra, author.

Title: Statehood under water : challenges of sea-level rise to the continuity of Pacific island states / by Alejandra Torres Camprubí.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill Nijhoff, 2016. | Series: Legal aspects of sustainable development ; volume 22 | Based on author's thesis (doctoral—Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, 2014) issued under title: Climate change and international security:—Revealing new challenges to the continuation of Pacific islands' statehood. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016013018 (print) | LCCN 2016013371 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004321601 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9789004321618 (Hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Islands of the Pacific—International status. | Global warming—Law and legislation. | Sea level—Social aspects—Islands of the Pacific | Coast changes—Social aspects—Islands of the Pacific

Classification: LCC KZ4730 .T67 2016 (print) | LCC KZ4730 (ebook) | DDC 341.26—dc23

LC record available at <http://lcn.loc.gov/2016013018>

ISSN 1875-0923

ISBN 978-90-04-32160-1 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-32161-8 (e-book)

Copyright 2016 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Hes & De Graaf, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Rodopi and Hotei Publishing.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

Contents

Series Editor's Preface XI

Prof. David Freestone

Prologue XII

Prof. Carlos Espósito Massicci

Acknowledgements XIV

List of Relevant International Instruments and National

Legislation XVIII

List of Cases XXIII

List of Acronyms XXV

List of Figures and Tables XXVII

Introduction: The Law on Statehood in the Anthropocene 1

0.1 'Statehood under Water': An Allegory of the Law on Statehood in the Anthropocene 1

0.2 The Oscillation of the Law on Statehood: Between Stability and Flexibility 3

0.3 Changing Scales: From Climate Change to the Anthropocene 9

1 The Challenge of De-Territorialisation 15

1.0 Introduction 15

1.1 Territorialisation of Nationhood: Fundamental Factor in the Creation of States 18

1.1.1 *The Meaning of Territory at the Inception of the Modern European State* 18

A From Feudal Allegiance to the Westphalian Principle of Territorial Sovereignty 18

B Pre-Charter Theories on the Legal Nature of State Territory 24

1.1.2 *The Meaning of Territory in the Creation of Post-Colonial Pacific Island States* 31

A Decolonisation and the Creation of Pacific Island States 31

B Newly Independent Micro-States in the United Nations 39

- 1.2 Partial De-Territorialisation: Maritime Spaces in Jeopardy 47
 - 1.2.1 *Effects of Coastal Geographical Changes on Maritime Rights* 47
 - A Sea-Level Rise and Undelimited Maritime Boundaries 49
 - B Sea-Level Rise and Maritime Delimitation Agreements 81
 - 1.2.2 *Reactions to the Loss of Maritime Spaces* 98
 - A Protecting the Coasts 98
 - B 'Freezing' the Baselines 100
- 1.3 Total De-Territorialisation: From State Continuity to New Forms of Subjectivity 103
 - 1.3.1 *Applying New Strategies: 'Re-Territorialisation'* 104
 - A Cession or Purchase of Land from Another State 104
 - B Merger with Another State 109
 - 1.3.2 *Coining a New Category: De-Territorialised Pacific Island States* 110
 - A The Holy See and the Order of Malta: Existing Forms of 'Non-State Sovereign Entities' 110
 - B Towards the Recognition of 'Water States'? 112
- 1.4 Conclusions 114
- 2 The Challenge of De-Population 117
 - 2.0 Introduction 117
 - 2.1 The Facts: Climate-Induced Relocation in and among Pacific Island States 121
 - 2.1.1 *Regional Homogeneity of Preventive Relocation Actions* 123
 - A Common Vulnerabilities 123
 - B Common Responses 129
 - 2.1.2 *Regional Heterogeneity of Reactive Relocation Actions* 131
 - A Differing Scenarios 131
 - B Differential Factors 145
 - 2.2 The Proposal: A Multi-Layered Legal Scheme for Climate-Induced Relocation 148
 - 2.2.1 *Assessment of the Existing Approaches to Climate-Induced Relocation* 149
 - A Relevant Diagnosis and Legal Regimes Analysed 149
 - B Limited Normative and Institutional Solutions Proposed 159

- 2.2.2 *Proposal of a New Integrative and Pluralistic Approach* 165
 - A Widening the Spectrum of Applicable Legal Regimes 165
 - B (Re-)Introducing the Role of the State 166
- 2.3 Possible Scenarios: Applying the Multi-Layered Legal Scheme to Pacific Island States 169
 - 2.3.1 *'Safe' Statehood: National Relocations* 169
 - A Legal Framework in a Preventive Relocation Phase 169
 - B Legal Framework of the Reactive Phase 178
 - 2.3.2 *Endangered Statehood: Transnational Relocations* 185
 - A Legal Framework for Ongoing Partial De-Population 189
 - B Legal Framework for Prospective Total De-Population 198
- 2.4 Conclusions 204
- 3 **The Challenge of Government Failure** 208
 - 3.0 Introduction 208
 - 3.1 The National Challenge: Impacts on Pacific Islands' Domestic Governmental Capacity 212
 - 3.1.1 *Partial De-Territorialisation and De-Population: From 'Vulnerable' to 'Failed' States?* 212
 - A Controversial Labels: 'Failing', 'Failed', or 'Collapsed' States 212
 - B Controversial Assumption: From 'Failed State' to 'Extinct State'? 215
 - 3.1.2 *Total De-Territorialisation and De-Population: Pacific Island Governments in Exile* 219
 - A 'Traditional' Forms of Governments in Exile 219
 - B 'New' Climate-Induced Governments in Exile 221
 - 3.2 The International Challenge: Impacts on Pacific Islands' Capacity to Maintain International Relations 229
 - 3.2.1 *Pacific Island States in the International Community* 229
 - A General Active Participation in International Life 229
 - B Launch of the Climate Change and International Security Discourse 233
 - 3.2.2 *The International Community and Pacific Island States* 244
 - A Creation of Pacific Island States: Past Reflection of the De-colonisation Movement 244
 - B Extinction of Pacific Island States: Future Reflection of the 'Limits to Growth'? 245

3.3	Exploring Normative Grounds for the Continuity of Pacific Islands States	246
3.3.1	<i>Remedies for Climate Change Loss and Damage</i>	246
	A Principal Remedy: Economic Compensation	246
	B Subsidiary Remedy: Recognition of State Continuity or New Forms of International Political Support	256
3.3.2	<i>Sources of Legitimacy for the Continuity of Pacific Islands States</i>	262
	A The Wider Context: A Global, Southern, and Post-Colonial Issue	262
	B The Turn to the Peoples: Self-Determination and the Future of Pacific Islands' Statehood	268
3.4	Conclusions	270
	Conclusions	274
	Physical Reality and Legal Construct: A Correlation Revisited	274
	The Looming Transformation of the Three Dimensions of the State	275
	From Statehood to International Legal Personality? The Adaptation of the Law on Statehood to the Anthropocene	277
	Bibliography	279
	Index	307