

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# THE LEGAL REGIME OF STRAITS

Contemporary Challenges and Solutions

HUGO CAMINOS  
VINCENT P. COGLIATI-BANTZ

**SARCHI CHAIR LAW**

 **CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107003767](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107003767)

© Hugo Caminos and Vincent P. Cogliati-Bantz 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Caminos, Hugo, author.

The legal regime of straits : contemporary challenges and solutions / Hugo Caminos, Vincent P. Cogliati-Bantz.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-00376-7 (hardback)

1. Straits. I. Cogliati-Bantz, Vincent P., author. II. Title.

KZ3760.C36 2014

341.4'46 - dc23 2014034073

ISBN 978-1-107-00376-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## CONTENTS

|  |           |
|--|-----------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>  | xiii      |
| Introduction   | 1         |
| <b>PART I Law of peace and law of war</b>  | <b>9</b>  |
| 1 Straits and the law of war   | 11        |
| 1.1 General remarks  | 11        |
| 1.2 Treaty regimes   | 15        |
| 1.3 A law of war for straits?  | 19        |
| 1.3.1 States bordering straits as belligerents   | 20        |
| 1.3.1.1 Relations with enemy vessels and aircraft  | 20        |
| 1.3.1.2 Relations with neutral vessels and aircraft  | 24        |
| 1.3.2 States bordering straits as neutrals   | 30        |
| <b>PART II Right of transit passage <i>ratione loci</i>: straits used for international navigation</b>   | <b>37</b> |
| 2 Applicability of the right of transit passage under UNCLOS   |           |
| Part III: exclusions   | 41        |
| 2.1 Straits where freedom of navigation applies: Article 36 and the 'similar convenience' exception to the inapplicability of Part III                     | 42        |
| 2.2 Straits where non-suspendable innocent passage applies   | 46        |
| 2.2.1 Island exception: Article 38(1) and the 'similar convenience' condition  | 46        |
| 2.2.2 Straits used for international navigation ending in the territorial sea of a foreign State: Article 45(1)(b)   | 54        |
| 2.3 Internal waters within straits   | 58        |
| 2.3.1 General principle  | 58        |
| 2.3.2 Exception to the general principle: Part III affects internal waters enclosed by straight baselines which did not have the status of internal waters | 64        |
| 2.4 Straits in which passage is regulated in whole or in part by long-standing international conventions in force specifically relating                    |           |

|   |   |            |
|---|---|------------|
|   | to such straits and straits regulated by international agreement compatible with the UNCLOS             | 71         |
|   | 2.4.1 Article 35(c): issues of construction   | 72         |
|   | 2.4.2 The Turkish Straits   | 77         |
|   | 2.4.3 The Danish Straits  | 89         |
|   | 2.4.4 The Strait of Magellan  | 98         |
|   | 2.4.5 The Åland Strait  | 104        |
|   | 2.4.6 Straits regulated by international agreement compatible with the UNCLOS                           | 107        |
| 3 | Applicability of the right of transit under Part III: straits used for international navigation defined | 109        |
|   | 3.1 Natural passages  | 109        |
|   | 3.2 Legal geography   | 112        |
|   | 3.3 Legal functionality: used for international navigation  | 115        |
|   | 3.3.1 International navigation  | 117        |
|   | 3.3.2 Use   | 122        |
|   | 3.3.2.1 Use as additional requirement   | 122        |
|   | 3.3.2.2 Use as scalar concept   | 127        |
|   | 3.3.2.2.1 Future use  | 128        |
|   | 3.3.2.2.2 Natural and assisted navigation   | 131        |
|   | 3.3.2.2.3 Amount and type of use  | 135        |
|   | <b>PART III Right of transit <i>ratione materiae</i>: definition of transit passage</b>                 | <b>151</b> |
| 4 | Transit passage and other passage rights  | 153        |
|   | 4.1 Transit passage and freedom of navigation and overflight  | 153        |
|   | 4.2 Transit passage and innocent passage  | 159        |
|   | 4.3 Transit passage and archipelagic sea lanes passage  | 168        |
|   | 4.3.1 Concept of archipelagic waters  | 168        |
|   | 4.3.1.1 Emergence of a new regime   | 168        |
|   | 4.3.1.2 Archipelagic waters in the UNCLOS   | 176        |
|   | 4.3.2 Navigational rights in archipelagic waters  | 181        |
|   | 4.3.2.1 Innocent passage  | 181        |
|   | 4.3.2.2 Archipelagic sea lanes passage  | 184        |
|   | 4.3.2.2.1 General   | 184        |
|   | 4.3.2.2.2 The geographical scope of the right: the designation of sea lanes                             | 187        |
|   | 4.3.2.2.3 Application: Indonesian archipelagic sea lanes  | 194        |
|   | 4.3.2.3 Further developments and conclusions  | 201        |
| 5 | Transit passage defined   | 206        |

|  |   |     |
|--|---|-----|
| 5.1  | Continuous and expeditious passage  | 206 |
| 5.2  | Geographical scope  | 208 |
| 5.3  | Recipients of the right of transit: all ships and aircraft  | 211 |
| 5.4  | Loss of the right of transit?   | 217 |
| <b>PART IV Allocation of jurisdiction over the right of transit passage and archipelagic sea lanes passage</b> |   |     |
| <b>225</b>   |   |     |
| 6  | Sovereignty of States bordering straits and archipelagic States   | 227 |
| 7  | Limitations to the sovereignty of States bordering straits and archipelagic States: rights and duties of coastal States               | 231 |
| 7.1  | General   | 231 |
| 7.2  | Adoption of archipelagic sea lanes, sea lanes, traffic separation schemes and other routing measures: joint process                   | 234 |
| 7.3  | Limitations to the prescriptive jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States regarding passage: scope of content  | 243 |
| 7.3.1  | General   | 243 |
| 7.3.2  | Article 42(1)(a)  | 246 |
| 7.3.3  | Article 42(1)(b)  | 251 |
| 7.3.3.1  | Scope   | 251 |
| 7.3.3.2  | Applicable international regulations: definition  | 254 |
| 7.3.4  | Article 42(1)(c)  | 257 |
| 7.3.5  | Article 42(1)(d)  | 259 |
| 7.3.6  | Publicity   | 260 |
| 7.3.7  | Scope <i>ratione personae</i> of laws and regulations   | 263 |
| 7.4  | Limitations to the prescriptive jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States relating to passage: scope of effect | 266 |
| 7.4.1  | Non-discrimination  | 266 |
| 7.4.2  | Negative effects on transit   | 267 |
| 7.5  | The special case of Articles 51 and 47(6)   | 268 |
| 7.5.1  | General rights granted to all States  | 268 |
| 7.5.1.1  | Existing agreements   | 268 |
| 7.5.1.2  | Rights relating to submarine cables   | 270 |
| 7.5.2  | Special rights granted to immediately adjacent neighbouring States  | 272 |
| 7.5.3  | The special case of Malaysia  | 275 |
| 7.6  | Limitations to the enforcement jurisdiction of States bordering straits and archipelagic States                                       | 280 |

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
| 7.6.1     | Enforcement and right of transit or archipelagic sea lanes passage                              | 280 |
| 7.6.1.1   | Principle   | 280 |
| 7.6.1.2   | Exceptions  | 281 |
| 7.6.1.2.1 | United Nations Charter  | 281 |
| 7.6.1.2.2 | Article 233   | 282 |
| 7.6.1.2.3 | Article 233 and the Malacca and Singapore straits under-keel clearance requirement              | 288 |
| 7.6.1.2.4 | Article 234   | 291 |
| 7.6.2     | General remedies available to the coastal State   | 292 |
| 7.7       | International responsibility of the coastal State   | 296 |
| 8         | Duties of ships and aircraft in transit   | 298 |
| 8.1       | General compliance duties of ships and aircraft in transit                                      | 298 |
| 8.2       | Specific duties of ships  | 301 |
| 8.2.1     | Article 40  | 301 |
| 8.2.2     | Article 41(7)   | 304 |
| 8.2.3     | Article 42(4)   | 304 |
| 8.2.4     | Article 39(2)   | 304 |
| 8.2.4.1   | Scope   | 305 |
| 8.2.4.2   | Generally accepted international regulations, procedures and practices                          | 307 |
| 8.3       | Specific duties of aircraft   | 313 |
| 8.3.1     | Duty relating to radio frequency  | 314 |
| 8.3.2     | Duties relating to the Rules of the Air and safety of navigation                                | 316 |
| 8.4       | Enforcement of the duties of ships and aircraft   | 322 |
| 8.4.1     | Immune ships and aircraft   | 322 |
| 8.4.2     | Private vessels and civil aircraft  | 323 |
| 9         | Striking a balance between the sovereignty of States bordering straits and the right of transit | 326 |
| 9.1       | Measures that create a physical impediment to passage   | 327 |
| 9.1.1     | Termination of the right of transit   | 327 |
| 9.1.2     | Restriction of the right of transit   | 328 |
| 9.1.2.1   | Land reclamation  | 328 |
| 9.1.2.2   | Bridges and other structures  | 331 |
| 9.1.2.3   | Areas to be avoided   | 341 |
| 9.2       | Measures that create requirements to be met by transiting ships                                 | 343 |
| 9.3       | Elements for a balanced approach  | 352 |

|   |  |     |
|---|--|-----|
| <b>PART V International co-operation for the safety of navigation and the prevention, reduction and control of pollution in straits</b> |  | 357 |
| 10  | Preliminary remarks and genesis of Article 43 of the UNCLOS                    | 359 |
| 11  | Scope of Article 43: interpretation and suggested implementation               | 371 |
| 11.1  | Fees for service in the territorial sea, straits and archipelagic waters       | 371 |
| 11.2  | Co-operation by agreement  | 376 |
| 11.3  | Who are the users?   | 379 |
| 11.4  | Burden sharing and implementation of Article 43                                | 382 |
| 12  | Co-operative schemes: the special case of the Straits of Malacca and Singapore | 391 |
| <b>PART VI Multiple regimes for straits?</b>  |  | 403 |
| 13  | UNCLOS as general framework  | 405 |
| 14  | Marine protected areas   | 410 |
| 14.1  | UNCLOS   | 411 |
| 14.1.1  | Article 211(6)   | 411 |
| 14.1.2  | Article 234  | 413 |
| 14.2  | MARPOL 73/78   | 420 |
| 14.3  | Other conventional instruments   | 423 |
| 14.4  | Particularly Sensitive Sea Areas (PSSAs)                                       | 424 |
| 14.4.1  | General observations   | 424 |
| 14.4.2  | Impact on straits  | 430 |
| <b>PART VII Conclusions</b>   |  | 443 |
| 15  | Straits and dispute settlement   | 445 |
| 15.1  | Settlement of disputes under the UNCLOS: brief overview                        | 445 |
| 15.2  | Disputes over the straits regime   | 448 |
| 16  | Transit passage and customary law  | 452 |
| 16.1  | International custom and international conventions                             | 452 |
| 16.2  | The UNCLOS, transit passage and customary international law                    | 460 |
| 16.2.1  | Opinion of writers   | 460 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 16.2.2 Practice and <i>opinio juris</i> | 462 |
| 16.2.3 Archipelagic sea lanes passage   | 470 |
| 17 Concluding remarks                   | 473 |
| <i>Bibliography</i>                     | 476 |
| <i>Index</i>                            | 498 |

R  
G  
I  
T  
N  
A  
I  
S  
  
I  
N  
T  
E  
D  
I  
T  
E  
D  
I  
N  
T  
E  
R  
N  
A  
T  
I  
O  
N  
A  
L  
L  
I  
G  
N  
M  
E  
N  
T  
S  
  
I  
N  
T  
E  
R  
N  
A  
T  
I  
O  
N  
A  
L  
L  
I  
G  
N  
M  
E  
N  
T  
S